The Silk Road

Volume 3  Number 1  June 2005

“The Bridge between Eastern and Western Cultures”

In This Issue

- Xinjiang: China’s Pre- and Post-Modern Crossroad
- Uyghur Art Music and Chinese Silk Roadism
- Polychrome Rock Paintings in the Altay Mountains
- Viticulture and Viniculture in the Turfan Region
- Annotated Bibliography of Xinjiang and Adjoining Regions
- Bactrian Camels and Bactrian-Dromedary Hybrids
- The Khataynameh of Ali Akbar

From the Editor

Xinjiang, the focus of several contributions to this issue, hardly needs to be introduced to readers of The Silk Road. While the designation Xinjiang is a modern one, the territory occupied by today’s Xinjiang-Uighur Autonomous Region in China embraces the earliest history of exchange in and across Inner Asia. That framing of the region as an administrative unit has to be considered rather artificial though in view of its vast size and its geographic and ethnic diversity. Whatever the modern political myths and realities, Xinjiang was never really a unified territory historically. In the longue durée Chinese control of the region occupies a relatively small part of its history. It was even more rarely the center of an independent state with any longevity. The history is often one of attempting to control some portion of the region from its periphery — from just beyond its eastern edge at Dunhuang, or north of the mountains in Urumqi, or at its far western end at Kashgar. Not infrequently the political and cultural centers of importance for the region were beyond the Kunlun and Karakorum Mountains or over the passes in Ferghana.

When studying the Silk Road (or any other history which begins in centuries so far removed from our own), we need continually to ask to what degree we should begin in the present. The famous Belgian medievalist Henri Pirenne, on arriving in Stockholm for a conference, set out with another famous medievalist Marc Bloch to explore the city. As Bloch tells it, when he asked his companion where they should begin, Pirenne responded, “If I were an antiquarian, I would have eyes only for old stuff, but I am a historian. Therefore, I love life.” Bloch then adds, “This faculty of understanding the living is, in very truth, the master quality of the historian.” [The Historian’s Craft, 1953 ed., p. 43]

It is appropriate then that the first of our contributions to this issue is Dru Gladney’s impressive overview of a broad span of Xinjiang’s history, bringing the story down to the “post-modern” present. Gladney is one of the leading authorities on the ethnic diversity of the region and is singularly well informed about the challenges of the present and the region’s future. Whether modernizing policies of promoting cultural integration will ultimately suppress the historic divisions within the region remains to be seen. It is clear that Chinese perceptions of Xinjiang’s strategic and economic importance today will ensure a continuing focus on the region. Yet it is useful to remember that while this latest phase of Chinese rule in Xinjiang is now about two-and-a-half centuries old, during that period large sections of the region were often quite independent of the central Government. The present lives in the shadow of the experience of the Han and T’ang dynasties, which ultimately had to abandon any pretense of control in the region.

Our second contributor, James Millward, has written the best study of the Qing Dynasty’s
implementation of its rule there. In his essay here he turns to a different topic: how music has been used politically in constructing and interpreting identities. As students of the Silk Road know, the popularity of musicians and other entertainers from the oases of the Tarim Basin and places further west is one of the striking proofs of the transnational cultural exchange in T’ang times. Even then though, their foreignness raised the hackles of those who saw a threat to Chinese values. The issues today involving music are somewhat different, since there are political dangers in promoting national cultures simultaneously with artificially denying the transnational nature of that musical heritage. Those familiar with the substantial literature on Soviet nationality policies are well aware of how the government’s “affirmative action” policies backfired in creating the conditions for the emergence of independent states.

We continue here our practice of providing bibliographic resources for further study. Nathan Light’s magnificent bibliography will help considerably those who wish to read more in the latest literature on Xinjiang. I can also recommend his website as one of the richest collections of materials and links on the region and in particular on the Uyghurs and their culture.

Our other contributions cover a diversity of material. Wang Binghua is one of the most distinguished contributors to the continuing archaeological investigation of Xinjiang. His essay on the little known rock paintings in northern Xinjiang provides the basis for tantalizing hypotheses about pre-historic culture. We expect to feature a recent interview with him in an upcoming issue. Xinru Liu is known to all students of the Silk Road for her books integrating the study of religion and material culture. Here she explores a topic connected with the fame of Turpan as a center of viniculture. Dan Potts’ essay on the Bactrian camel comes from a lecture he gave at Stanford for the Silkroad Foundation’s series. He clarifies issues regarding the evidence concerning Bactrian camels in areas of the Middle East which were not part of the animal’s indigenous range. Ralph Kauz will be lecturing at Columbia this autumn in a new series sponsored by the Foundation. His research report on his translation of a little known Persian source for Inner Asian history reminds us, as does Wang Binghua’s piece, that just when we thought we were beginning to gain control over the primary sources, others are being brought to our attention.

This issue of The Silk Road comes at an important moment in my personal acquaintance with Xinjiang, since for the first time this summer, thanks to arrangements made by Adela Lee, the head of the Silkroad Foundation and Wang Binghua, I will have a chance to visit Urumqi, see the famous Tarim mummies and explore in the Kazakh and Mongol areas north of the Tien Shan.

On my return I hope to finish work on precisely the kind of modern topic which proves to be enlightening about the earlier history of the Silk Roads. The focus is the writings of C. P. Skrine, the British consul in Kashgar in 1922-24, whose book on Chinese Central Asia is still a very valuable source of information. Skrine’s unpublished writings and his official reports supplement what the book reveals about the transnational connectedness of Xinjiang and the continuation of historic trade patterns. In Skrine’s time the camel caravans of the Silk Road era were still the transport of choice, even if then they might be loaded with oil from Baku on the Caspian Sea.

Daniel Waugh
History Department
University of Washington
Seattle
dwaugh@u.washington.edu
In all of China, there are only three public statues left of Chairman Mao. Of the three, the one in Xinjiang is perhaps the most incongruous. It is in Kashgar, the farthest city in China from Beijing, and in a place never visited by the Chairman. With arm upraised, gazing across the People’s Square toward the southern end of the city (and India/Pakistan), Chairman Mao’s statue signals that though it is one of the most remote cities from Beijing, since 1949 it has been firmly under Chinese control. Bordering People’s Square and well within the Chairman’s gaze is the huge new Bank of China building — the newest monument to Chinese rule. Yet, it has not always been so.

Xinjiang remains one of the pivotal crossroads of China and Central Asia, and has only been intermittently under Chinese influence and control during relatively recent times in its 3000-year history. The history of the region is marked by many influences due to its central place between several civilizations. At a natural intersection of pathways leading from the ancient capitals of Rome, Persia, Mongolia, and China, its strategic location at the eastern end of the ancient Silk Road, it continues today as a meeting place of many cultures. Sir Aurel Stein, the 20th century’s greatest Central Asian explorer, characterized the region as a “special meeting ground of Chinese civilization, introduced by trade and political penetration, and of Indian culture, propagated by Buddhism.” Islam contributed Arab, Persian, and later Turkic civilizations to the region. The new “Trans-Eurasia” railroad between Europe and China that passes through Urumqi, completed in 1991, links China as never before with Europe; in addition, there is an increasing number of air and road routes to Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan, Tajikistan, Mongolia, Afghanistan, and Pakistan. Bordered by some of the highest mountains in the world, in the north, east, south and southwest by the great Altai, Tianshan, Pamir, and Kunlun mountain ranges, and hemmed in from the west by the Gobi and Taklamakan Deserts, the second largest in the world, Xinjiang is a place with a long and complicated history, located somewhere between mountain and steppe, oasis and desert, East and West. The faces, languages, clothing, and dwellings of the “Eastern Turkestanis” who inhabit the towns and the new “golden hordes” of travelers who pass through are the most enduring legacy of this multicultural and diverse history.

Today, over sixty percent of Xinjiang’s eighteen million citizens are Muslims, living across an area one-sixth the size of all of China. Under the Chinese Communists, Muslims were divided among ten official nationalities, with the Hui the largest population throughout China, and the Uyghur the largest population in the Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region, established in 1956. According to the reasonably accurate 2000 national census of China, the total Muslim population is 20.3 million, including: Hui (9,816,805); Uyghur (8,399,393); Kazakh (1,250,458); Dongxiang (513,805); Kyrgyz (160,823); Salar (104,503); Tajik (41,028); Uzbek (14,502); Bonan (16,505); Tatar (4,890). This represents about a forty percent population increase over 1990 census figures. The Hui speak mainly Sino-Tibetan languages; Turkic-language speakers include the Uyghur, Kazakh, Kyrgyz, Uzbek, Salar and Tatar; combined Turkic-Mongolian speakers include the Dongxiang and Bonan, concentrated in Gansu’s mountainous Hexi corridor; and the Tajik speak a variety of Indo-Persian dialects. It is important to note, however, that the Chinese census registered people by nationality, not religious affiliation, so the actual number of Muslims is still unknown, and all population figures are clearly influenced by politics in their use and interpretation.

The largest Muslim group in Xinjiang are the Uyghur, numbering nearly nine million, claiming a 1300-year history of descent from the early Uyghur kingdom in Karabalghasan, located in what is now Mongolia, whose kingdom was conquered by Kyrgyz tribesmen in 840 CE. The Uyghur fled southwest and dispersed in the oases towns surrounding the Taklamakan desert where they had maintained trading relations along the ancient Silk Road, establishing Turfan as their newfound capital and Kashgar as one of its most important trading centers. Their far-flung kingdom flourished until the coming of the Mongols in the twelfth century. Prior to the arrival of the Mongols, Islam first arrived in Kashgar by the tenth century CE, and the city became such a center of Islamic learning that one of the greatest Muslim scholars and lexicographers of the eleventh...
century, Mahmud al-Kashgari, was buried just outside of the city in Upar Village (Fig. 1). Al-Kashgari compiled the first complete Turkish dictionary, which has been translated into 26 languages (Fig. 2). Here, the early Muslims encountered strong Chinese, Persian, Turkic, and Indian influences, much of which can still be seen in the art and architecture of the region.

Islam displaced a multi-religious and multi-cultural tradition that combined elements of Buddhist, Manichaean, Zoroastrian, and even early Nestorian Christian practices (by 650 CE, there was a Nestorian archbishopric in Kashgar), reflecting the importance of the region as a meeting place of many cultures and kingdoms. Islam displaced a multi-religious and multi-cultural tradition that combined elements of Buddhist, Manichaean, Zoroastrian, and even early Nestorian Christian practices (by 650 CE, there was a Nestorian archbishopric in Kashgar), reflecting the importance of the region as a meeting place of many cultures and kingdoms. 

Early Persian records refer to the southern Tarim region as the home of Kushan tribes, who controlled trade with other Silk Road oases as early as 2000 years ago. The regularity of the caravan trade between the oases of Merv, Balkh, Bukhara, Samarkand, Kashgar, Turpan, and Khotan with the distant European and Asian capitals placed this region in a central role as economic broker and cultural mediator. Hinayana Buddhism flourished in the southern Tarim basin from the second to the tenth centuries CE, when the Chinese monk, Xuanzang (Hsuan-tsang), reported in 644 CE that the oasis city of Kashgar produced a “luxuriance of fruit and flowers.” Xuanzang was impressed not only with the widespread practice of Buddhism, but also with the vibrancy of the bazaar and multi-ethnic character of the people, some with “blue eyes” and “yellow hair,” perhaps of Sogdian or East Iranian origin. That diversity is evident to today, where the daily market attracts thousands, and the famous Sunday bazaar (Fig. 3, next page) boasts over ten thousand, including Han Chinese, Uyghur, Russian, Tajik, Kyrgyz, Uzbek, and Kazakh patrons, as well as the ubiquitous foreign tourists.

As a trading region, southern Xinjiang grew under the Han Chinese General Ban Qiao who campaigned in the region for 31 years in the first century, and remained under nominal Chinese control until the early T’ang dynasty, but succumbed to Tibetan rule between 670 and 694. From the tenth to the twelfth centuries, the Karakhanid Khanate, an alliance of Karlukh Turkic tribes that had accepted Islam, established their capital in Kashgar, and ruled the surrounding trading centers from Bukhara to Khotan. The Sunni Muslim, Satoq Bughra, who died around 955 CE, is credited with introducing Islam to Xinjiang. A Turk from the clan of the Karakhanids, he was converted to Islam by Nasr b. Mansur of the Samanid family who had been ruling eastern Iran and much of Central Asia and Transoxiana, and was supposedly sent to the Kashgar region on a trade mission, where he eventually became khan. He and his devout successors extended Islamic influence throughout the southern oases, where Buddhism had once boasted 160 monasteries in Khotan alone. On the eastern end of the Tarim basin in places like Hami and perhaps parts of Turfan, Uyghurs continued to practice Buddhism until the sixteenth century. Today, the 162 Sunni mosques in Kashgar alone evidence the enduring presence of Islam, though Buddhist influence can be found in the extraordinarily multi-varied artwork, music, and dance
produced by the Uyghur people (Fig. 4). Sufism also gained many followers among the Sunni Muslims, with mostly Central Asian Yasawi and later Naqshbandi tarikats finding followers. Inter-ethnic and religious rivalries increased until the region came under the Mongol rule through Chagatai, the son of Genghis Khan, until Tamerlane’s army was able to reclaim Kashgar for a brief period in the mid-fourteenth century. The Persian historian Ala-ad-Din Ata-Malik Juvaini in his visit to the region during the mid-thirteenth century reported that Mongolian rule was a “divine mercy,” actually felt by local Eastern Turkestani’s to reduce intra-religious factionalism in the region.

Throughout the period of Mongol rule the region prospered as an important overland trade center in the midst of the peace insured by the Pax Mongolica. It was after this period that Islam continued to flourish, especially in the southern region, with the establishment in Kashgar of the great Idgah Masjid (the Festival Mosque), in 1444, where Muslims still gather in the main square for Qurban and Ramadan holidays. On these days, Uyghurs dance the “sama” in the square, recite the great Uyghur Mukharum epics, and celebrate the unity of Islam in the region. The rise of the Sufi inspired Khojas (from the Persian Khwaja, “master”), and their internecine struggles for power that raged between Kashgar and Yarkand from the sixteenth to the nineteenth centuries, saw political and religious competition for influence over the strategic southern region, and their conflicts only ended with Qing rule under Emperor Qianlong in 1754. Today, many of the tombs of the Khojas can still be visited in the Apak Khoja tomb complex in the north end of Kashgar, built originally in 1640 (Fig. 5).

Unlike the Chinese Ming dynasty (1368-1644) before them, the Manchu Qing (1644-1911) were more interested in trade with Central and Inner Asia, and the Emperor Qian Long extended Chinese rule through powerful military and economic integration of the region. Chinese rule was disrupted, however, by the rise of the Kashgar ruler, Yakub Beg, who from 1866-1877 established a Uyghur Muslim kingdom in the region. Yakub Beg took advantage of shifting power struggles in the region during the period of the so-called Great Game, when Russian, British, and Chinese empires competed for control over the strategic
overland routes that ran through Xinjiang, coming to an end in 1884 when Chinese rule was established and the term "Xinjiang" became widely used for the first time to refer to the entire region as a "new dominion" of Qing imperial control. Until this time, the region was generally referred to as "Eastern Turkestan" or "Chinese Turkestan," and even "High Tatary" in Owen Lattimore's words. With the overthrow of the Qing dynasty in 1910, the region was once again a site of intense competition for control, particularly between the expanding Soviet penetration of Central Asia and the attempts of the Chinese Nationalist Kuomintang to retain the old Qing boundaries of China, that included Tibet and Xinjiang.

As Kuomintang Chinese rule in Xinjiang eroded during the 1930s and 1940s, several Uyghur-led rebellions broke out. Two "East Turkestan Republics" sought to establish separate Muslim states, both influenced strongly by the threat of the neighboring USSR. Intensive maneuvering enabled the first to survive from 1931 to 1934 and the second from 1944 to 1949. It is tempting to dismiss these abortive states or Yakub Beg's brief rule in the previous century as mere adventures. But it is clear that Mao Zedong took them seriously, detecting in them the presence of powerful centripetal forces that could seriously undermine Communist rule. Civil war, inter-ethnic conflicts between Hui Chinese Muslims, Uyghur and Han Chinese, despotic nationalist rule under Sheng Shicai, and fear of Russian expansion, led Xinjiang citizens weary of war and civil strife to welcome the "peaceful liberation" of the region by People's Liberation Army soldiers in 1949. By 1957, Urumqi was a key city in the newly formed Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region, and the PRC government sought to further integrate the region into People's China through national education, telecommunications, and political development. It is for this reason that Mao Zedong, after his troops "liberated" Xinjiang, agreed upon the legal designation of special governance of the region, under the title "Xinjiang Autonomous Region." This makes Xinjiang one of five Autonomous Regions in China, including Tibet, Ningxia, Inner Mongolia, and Guangxi (in southern China). It is also significant that Mao's own brother died during efforts to wrest Xinjiang from Nationalist rule. So for many reasons Xinjiang has always posed an enormous challenge to Chinese rule, whether Communist, Nationalist, or Imperial, providing a legacy fraught with danger, but promising enormous wealth.

China's integrationist and educational policies since 1949 have enormously expanded the ranks of the Turkic urban intelligentsia in Xinjiang. Turkic, mainly Uyghur and Kazakh, intellectuals advanced in many fields but also encountered impediments as well. Whether or not they considered themselves Uyghur prior to their encounters with the Han Chinese establishment in Xinjiang, many came to think of themselves as Uyghur afterwards. By such a process that directly recalls what took place earlier in the Soviet republics of Central Asia, the ethnic and national policies of a Communist state fostered the development, if not the creation, of new ethnic national consciousnesses (Fig. 6). In Xinjiang, as well as other minority areas of China, official minority nationalities receive special benefits, such as exemption from the one-child birth program (minorities are generally allowed two or three children, and in very poor areas, even more), special scholarships to secondary and higher educational institutions, tax relief, and bi-lingual education schools that teach in the local minority languages up through university. In addition, minority government officials are actively recruited in order to promote a sense of participation in governance. Nevertheless, the Chinese Communist Party, which has many fewer minorities and is generally the final authority in areas of governance, continues to exercise the greatest power in the region.

In addition, one cannot minimize the role of improved communications and transportation in the creation of a region-wide consciousness among Xinjiang's Turkic peoples. The ability to travel easily by truck,
bus, or railroad enables people of modest means to form contacts with Turkic speakers hundreds of miles from home. Radio and television broadcasts in the Uyghur language and improved telephone connections also facilitate interaction over distances. Taken together, these very different developments have fueled an unprecedented growth of national consciousness among the Uyghur Turks of Xinjiang, which in turn gives rise to a nationalist force that is different in kind and strength from any that had existed in the past.

The social base of this new consciousness does not correspond precisely to the borders of Xinjiang. The northern Kazakhs remain somewhat disengaged, perhaps because of their own rivalries with the Uyghur and the rise of an independent Kazakhstan, and most of the other large ethnic groups, such as the Hui, Kyrgyz, and Xinjiang Han, see their best chances in cooperating with Chinese rule rather than objecting to it. Traditional divides between traditionally agrarian and urban Muslim populations (Uyghur and Hui), and the formerly nomadic Muslim populations (Kazakh and Kyrgyz), continue to this day. Not unlike Western American rivalries between ranchers and farmers, the agrarian Uyghur and Hui are concentrated in the oases and towns, whereas the Kazakh and Kyrgyz are based in the higher-elevation mountainous regions of the Pamir, Tianshan, and Altai ranges. Although the majority of the Kazakh and Kyrgyz no longer derive their primary incomes from herding, there are still nearly thirty percent of their populations who are registered as "pastoralists" (mu min), and maintain a fairly nomadic lifestyle, moving their entire families with their mixed herds (sheep, cattle, camels, horses, and even yaks) from the summer pastures in the higher elevation to the winter pastures along the lower-elevation steppe zones. This nomadic pastoralist lifestyle was severely curtailed during the more radical Maoist periods of the 1960s and 1970s, but under the Deng Xiaoping reform era, began to return in a vibrant fashion. Under the market economy, pastoral products have increased in demand to the extent in many areas, herd sizes have increased beyond the natural carrying capacity of the grasslands. The government has attempted to resolve this conflict through sedentarization policies that have had mixed results. In addition, traditional competition for scarce resources (farmland versus grazing land) has led to ethnic conflict between pastoralists (Kazakh and Kyrgyz) and farmers (mainly Uyghur, Han, and Hui).

Beijing has based its approach to regional governance on principles of standardization, centralization and assimilation. Given this, it was probably inevitable that this some Uyghurs who had hoped for greater autonomy would clash with policies of the Peoples’ Republic of China in many areas. Many Uyghurs, especially younger urban males, have reacted to Beijing’s "top down" style of rule with covert and overt shows of resistance. Some support ecological causes, greater religious freedoms, native language training, programs to prevent and treat AIDS, or even anti-alcohol campaigns, and yet others actively engage in illegal activities, such as drug-smuggling and acts of violence. As a result, perhaps of China’s more "open door" policy of Deng Xiaoping and his successors, the level of civil unrest increased dramatically during the 1990s. Chinese government sources enumerate almost daily incidents of violence, and Amnesty International released a series of reports condemning China’s harsh treatment of those accused of separatism. Particularly bloody confrontations occurred at the town of Baren in 1990 and in Yining in 1997. The government was quick to blame these outbreaks on separatists (called "splittists"), Muslim radicals, or terrorists, and designed its indelicately named "Strike Hard! Maximum Pressure!" campaign explicitly to counter them. The "Strike Hard" campaign officially ended in 2004, and there have not been any violent clashes in the region since the late 1990s. Nevertheless, the government has continued to restrict public gatherings and any activities, religious or otherwise, that might be regarded as supporting separatism.

In a rather post-modern twist along the ancient Silk Road, China’s so-called "war on terrorism" has been increasingly waged against a group of non-state actors, primarily living outside of China for at least two to three generations, largely organized through the Internet (in what I have termed cyber-separatism), for whom radical Islam has only recently begin to grow in appeal. Interestingly, this diasporic ethnoreligious identity has helped land 22 of them in the interrogation/detention cells at Guantánamo Bay, Cuba, caught up in the net of those accused of fighting for the Taliban and al-Qaida in Afghanistan. Not unlike Tibet, a place that has also seen religiously-motivated terrorism against the Chinese state, their rationale for violence can only be understood as ethnoreligious, combining land with liberation from a nation-state system that has wrested their religious homeland away from them, which they refer to as Eastern Turkestan or even Uyghuristan, but which the Chinese state has referred to as "Xinjiang" (or "New Territory") only since 1884. We must recall that the region has
always been caught between great power politics. In an effort to prevent the further expansion of the Russian tsarist empire across Central Asia, the Chinese emperor sent troops to finally incorporate the region into China proper, delineating a border with Russia near Ili (today’s Yining or Ghulja in Uyghur), in what the late Joseph Fletcher once called China’s “First Treaty Port.” Today, most travelers to the region report almost no evidence of civil unrest and attest to the fact that it is one of the safest places to travel in all of Central Asia, perhaps due to the strong presence of Chinese police in the region.

The seventh-century Buddhist monk Xuanzang’s comment still rings true today: the oasis cities, including Hami, Turpan, Aksu, Kashgar, and Hotan, continue to be green centers for fruit, vegetable, rice, wheat, bean, and cotton production. Vast energy and mineral resources have contributed to the region’s importance to China’s modernization goals. As an important part of China’s “Great Western Development” campaign, launched in 2001, the main challenge will be to maintain a cultural and religious continuity with the vibrant institutions and traditions that have made Xinjiang a diverse and welcoming stopping place for the weary traveler on the new Silk Road. The goals of the Great Western Development campaign have been to help the poorer Western regions “catch-up” with the more developed eastern and coastal regions, which received greater central government support during Deng Xiaoping’s “get rich quick” campaigns. Under former President Jiang Zemin, the western regions, particularly Xinjiang, Qinghai, Gansu, Tibet, Inner Mongolia, Sichuan, and Yunnan were targeted for greater infrastructural and communications investment, to the extent that vast road, rail, and telecommunications projects have been initiated. President Hu Jintao has continued with this program, but the huge gaps in income and social welfare between the west and southeast remain. Despite its “Freedom of Religion” policy which is enshrined in China’s constitution and cultural preservation programs that have sought to preserve minority culture, language, and material history through giving special privileges to minorities (including exemption from the one-child birth-planning policy, educational opportunities, and tax relief), the real threat to local Muslim culture may come more from modernization than from Chinese assimilation or migration (Fig. 7).

Yet, increasing Han Chinese migration to the region reflects a 2000-year history of cross-cultural trade and movement, and greater opportunities in the region have attracted a growing number of poorer Han Chinese from the inland regions, as well as skilled laborers and technicians that often displace the local population from gainful employment. Conversely, better-skilled Uyghur from urban areas with university educations are often attracted to the urban centers of China where they have more opportunities than in their homeland, or increasingly seek opportunities abroad where they feel they have a better chance at advancement than in Urumqi. This brain drain often divests the region from cultivating its own native elite. At the same time, developing cross-border trade with the new Central Asian states and growing international tourism has once again opened the region to an array of multinational influences. One can only hope that Uyghur and other local cultures will continue to flourish and develop in this new period of globalization.

About the Author

Dru Gladney is Professor of Asian Studies and Anthropology at the University of Hawaii at Manoa. Among his many publications on ethnic and cultural nationalism are Muslim Chinese: Ethnic Nationalism in the People’s Republic (Harvard University Press, 1991) and Dislocating China: Muslims, Minorities, and Other Subaltern Subjects (University of Chicago Press, 2004). He is currently finishing a book-length study entitled Nomadology: Borderline Identities and Peripheral Perspectives. He may be contacted at dru@hawaii.edu.

References


The performers themselves, as well as the audiences, learned much from the unprecedented juxtaposition of related traditions; musicians attended each other's performances, and using whatever common languages they could (mostly Turkic and Russian) they shared songs, techniques and fellowship both during the festival and after-hours at a local Holiday Inn. And over it all shone the smile of Yo-Yo Ma, whose intellectual and musical contribution to the festival was great, and whose own Silk Road Ensemble produces disks found under "world music" as well as in the classical bins (Ma 2002).

Though the Silk Road remains a potent symbol of transnationalism and interconnections between societies, the physical territory through which it passes has been carved up by some of the most pointedly divisive political projects of modern times. After Russian and Qing expansion divided Central Eurasia into discrete empires in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, their twentieth-century successor states hardened the border between Chinese and Soviet Central Asia and further subdivided the heart of the Silk Road into peoples and lands organized on national lines as "republics" and "autonomous" administrative units. As Theodore Levin has shown in his Central Asian musicological ethnography *Ten-thousand Fools of God*, Soviet nationality projects had a deep and complex impact upon the musics of the Central Asian republics (Levin 1996). Below, I explore a similar process at work under the PRC in Xinjiang.

**Popularity, Utility and Irony of the Silk Road Notion in China**

Though the Silk Road idea has proved popular in many places, perhaps no country has embraced it as thoroughly as China. A Google search on the characters *sichou zhi lu* ("silk road") reveals one dimension of this: the notion is a promotional bonanza, especially for the tourism industry, which entices Chinese as well as foreign tourists with the promise of Silk Road exotica (Fig. 1) and...
historical flavor. (At least one tour company even promotes the eastern Chinese cities of Shanghai and Suzhou as Silk Road “stations.”) Clothing companies, software retailers, restaurants and other enterprises are also fond of the associations evoked by the term. The top panel on the website www.silkroad.com.cn is a bulletin board posting classified ads for apartment rentals and second-hand goods.

The Silk Road metaphor also serves another sort of marketing goal: promoting the ideological agendas of the Chinese state. Popular histories, textbooks, and tourist sites associated with the Silk Road emphasize the silk trade, Buddhism, and the high imperial periods of the Han and T’ang Dynasties, when Chinese influence in what is now Xinjiang was at its pre-modern peak). Official China represents “the Silk Road” as a stage on which China plays the leading historical role. Just as early Euro-American scholarship on southwest Asia and India once focused on traces of lost classical civilizations and ignored or denigrated the more recent Islamic past, archaeology in the Tarim has de-emphasized the last, Islamic millennium in favor of Buddhist and pre-Buddhist antiquity and Han and T’ang-period artifacts. Documentaries such as the NHK Silk Road series and tourist itineraries generally follow suit. In Xinjiang’s westernmost, and still predominantly Uyghur and Muslim city of Kashgar where old Central Asia neighborhood mahallas and bazaars are giving way to urban renewal, developers recently built a faux ancient city-site commemorating the Han Dynasty general Ban Qiao, complete with a mini-Great Wall, “spirit road” flanked with life-size figures of soldiers and ministers (reminiscent of those at the Ming and Qing tombs in Beijing) and a statue of the conquering general himself, who consolidated his control of Kashgar in 87 by getting the local ruler and his men drunk and slaughtering them at a banquet. Pantuo City, as the park is called, has become a new station on the Silk Road, at least for some tourists.

More creditably, the Silk Road idea also resonates positively with developments in Xinjiang since the beginning of the Deng Xiaoping reforms in the 1980s. Under these reforms, and especially since the collapse of the Soviet union, the Xinjiang region has enjoyed renewed communications with Central Asia and increased autonomy from Beijing in dealing with foreign tourists, trade partners, investors, governments and NGOs. The general preface to a series of “Silk Road Researches” published by Xinjiang People’s Press makes the relevant connection:

... Some authors [in the series] have attempted to combine their [silk road] studies with the reform and the open door policy of China in hope that the past can serve the present and show what we can learn from our ancestors. ... There is no demand that the views of the authors should be in conformity with that of the editors. Instead, we appreciate the contention of different schools and ideas in the studies, for we believe that it is the only way to promote the Silk Road studies. ... It is not a coincidence that the [UNESCO-affiliated] Centre for Silk Road Studies, Urumchi, has been founded in Xinjiang: the most important section of the Silk Road. All this proves that a new age to rediscover and revitalize the great Silk Road has come to us [emphasis added] (Zhou 1993: 12-14).

There is an irony inherent in these various Chinese enthusiasms for the Silk Road metaphor, however. What stirs the greatest global interest in the Silk Road is not so much military exploits or even commerce along its length, but the cultural exchanges and continuities across vast tracts of inner Eurasia that it represents. This is what was celebrated on the National Mall, and is how world history textbooks in the US treat the Silk Road (e.g. Bentley and Ziegler 2003; Bulliet et al. 1997). Buddhism, Nestorian Christianity, Zoroastrianism, Manichaeism, Islam and associated ideas and arts all entered China via Xinjiang, as did Sogdians and other Central Asians. Many “traditional Chinese” musical instruments are themselves originally Central Asian or Indian imports, including the pipa lute, possibly the sanxian three-string lute, the yangqin hammer dulcimer, various spike fiddles collectively known as huqin, the dizi transverse flute, the double-reed suona, and several small percussion instruments (Thresher 2000: 36-56).

Copyright © Daniel C. Waugh 1995

Fig. 2. Dutars, Kashgar rawaps, and other instruments for sale in a stall in Kashgar.
Yet despite the silk road boosterism, Chinese authorities today are not terribly interested in cultural exchanges or non-commercial linkages over the revitalized Silk Road. In fact, one of the top priorities of Xinjiang’s security apparatus today lies precisely in preventing religious and political influences, people, news, and certain trade items (drugs and arms, understandably enough, but also video tapes and cassettes) from crossing its western borders. Far from rejoicing in transnational Silk Road connections, the PRC national project with regard to Xinjiang and its non-Han peoples has aimed to clearly demarcate geographic and ethnic borders, even attempting to erase or mute historical and cultural linkages that challenge the PRC claim to historical priority in the Xinjiang region and blur the discrete ethno-national categories that have formed the building blocks for the bureaucratic management of non-Han Chinese peoples in Xinjiang.

By these building blocks I refer to the state identification of the Uyghur, Kazak, Kirghiz, Uzbek, Tatar, Tajik and other nationalities and instillation of these categories with political and cultural content, a process known to scholars of Soviet Central Asia as korenizatsiia (“root-ization” or “indigenization”). The korenizatsiia of Uyghurs and other Xinjiang peoples actually began before the PRC came to power. In the 1930s, warlord Sheng Shicai accepted Soviet military and economic assistance to quell rebellions and consolidate his hold on power, and in return fell into lockstep with many Stalinist policies. Stalin’s overriding concern in Central Asia was to undermine “Turk” and “Islamic” as general identities by subdividing them into smaller, mutually exclusive and competitive niches. Because the boundaries between these categories were in some cases more theoretical than real on the ground, cultural projects followed to collect, isolate, edit, canonize and promote the supposedly discrete language, dance, music and literature of each nationality (Roy 2000). Sheng’s government in Xinjiang followed the same policies, also using political appointments and education to give political meaning to the fourteen nationalities into which it taxonomized Xinjiang peoples. The Eastern Turkestan Republic, which controlled northern Xinjiang from 1944-1949, did likewise, and the PRC in turn adopted the same categorization scheme, with only minor modifications. After the Chinese Communist Party consolidated its control over Xinjiang, PRC “cultural workers” from party and government agencies at local, regional and national levels devoted themselves to codifying the cultural attributes and achievements of each minzu, or “nationality.”

Uyghur Music—the Twelve Muqam

The official approach to Uyghur music (and to that of PRC minzu in general) had several purposes. One goal, especially in Maoist years, was make it “national in form, socialist in content.” With regard to Uyghur classical music, the muqam (defined below), this involved modifying lyrics to remove religious content or replace difficult Chaghatay ghazals by ‘Ali-Shir Nava‘i and other poets with modern Uyghur poetry (Light 1998: 57). Chinese choreographers produced dances on such subjects as “the Child Care Worker” in place of older dances that had been performed to the accompaniment of muqam (Mackerras 1985: 65).

Music in itself, being more abstract than lyrics or dance, does not directly convey verbal content or story-lines and thus might seem of less immediate concern to government and party authorities. Nevertheless, since 1949 the national PRC and regional Xinjiang governments have made collection, codification and republication of both classical and folk forms of Uyghur music a priority. The explicit rationale behind this project has been to preserve, order, develop, and modernize the Uyghur musical tradition. In practice this has involved several steps: collection, including recording, by local teams; selection of the “best” songs or, in the case of the muqam, ordering of the “authentic” tradition; transcription into western musical score or the Chinese numerical music notation; rearranging to “rationalize” rhythms, to include harmony or to set the music for the large ensembles (including western instruments) and dance troupes employed in stage concerts and song and dance shows; promulgation of the resulting product through publication of songbooks and scores and through radio, television and concert performances; and education in the state music and arts schools.

The French ethnomusicologist Sabine Trebinjac has shown that this process of “rewriting” Uyghur music brings it from Xinjiang localities through Beijing and back out to the localities again where the music is taught to the next generation of professional musicians in its revised, “modernized” and state-sanctioned form. While both the process and results of this project resemble those in the Soviet Union and there are clear borrowings from Soviet korenizatsiia practices, Trebinjac also argues that deep Chinese roots underlie the PRC efforts to put a state imprimatur on music of the minority nationalities.

Chinese compilers of folk songs today point to the Chinese classic the Book of Odes (Shijing) as precedent for their own compilation efforts. Moreover, in the Han Dynasty (206 BCE – 220
CE), the Ministry of Music employed functionaries to gather songs from around the empire, and then orchestrated them for performance on Chinese instruments with new court-approved texts. Trebinjac’s point is that Chinese governments have long invested music with political and ritual importance, and for this reason have endeavored to exert central control over diverse musical traditions and convert local and ethnic music into components of a unified Chinese national music. The modern expression of this urge, of course, is linked to the modernist idea that without the intervention of musicologists and arrangers trained in western music theory, Uyghur music would remain “primitive,” and unable to develop (Trabinjac 1990: 227-238; Trabinjac 2000). (This last notion was once shared by European imperialists with respect to the native music of their colonial subjects: some British colonial officials in India devoted themselves to collecting songs and transcribing them in western staff notation in order to rescue the tradition from degeneracy and restore its purity [Farrell 1997: chapter 2].)

The state music project emerges clearly in the recent history of the Uyghur muqam, a series of suites or song cycles that are considered by many Uyghurs to be the acme of Uyghur cultural achievement. In the mid-twentieth century, the muqam in Xinjiang consisted of a flexible tradition with many individual and regional styles (such as those of Kashgar, Ili, Dolan, and Qumul), passed onaurally from masters to disciples. During their apprenticeship, disciples would play percussion on the dap frame-drum while the master sang and played the dutar (a two-string long-necked lute), reewab (a mandolin-like lute with doubled strings and a round, skin-covered body) or tambur (another long-necked lute, with a doubled melody string) (see Wan 1986). In this way, the pupil could internalize the complex rhythms, poetic lyrics, melodies, and rules of ornamentation before performing muqam on a melodic instrument themselves. For the most part, it appears, Uyghur musicians traditionally did not perform whole cycles, but rather isolated pieces or sections of muqam.

Both Ahmetjan Qasimi (leader of the Eastern Turkestan Republic in northern Xinjiang in the 1940s) and Seypidin Eziz (Saifuding; former member of the ETR government who served later under the PRC both as regional vice chairman and chairman of the Xinjiang Nationalities Committee) sought to promote the muqam, and particularly the twelve muqams (on ikki muqam) tradition of Kashgar, as the prestige music of the Uyghur people (Light 1998: 55). In the 1950s an orchestra director from Nanjing, together with scholars in the Muqam Research Group, were charged with collecting and organizing the suites, which in fact were extant as an unsystematic living tradition with more than twelve suite names overall, and with no one performer’s or regional tradition’s repertoire including exactly twelve complete suites. The collection and editing project thus focused on “reconstructing” an imagined former system of twelve and only twelve complete muqam suites, each consisting of about thirty songs and instrumentals. In the event, it was the muqam tradition as known and performed by one master, Turdi Akhun, that became the basis of the canon of the twelve muqams that was recorded, reordered, transcribed and published in 1960 (Wan 1959). This and subsequent editions (also based solely on the repertoire of Turdi Akhun) have become the foundation of most pedagogy and professional performance of the muqams in Xinjiang, while other variant traditions from Tarim Basin cities are dismissively treated as “local” or “individual.” There remains little if any room for improvisation in muqam performance, as many of the movements are now played by orchestras rather than small groups of a singer and one to four instrumentalists. Thus preserved, systematized and frozen, the Uyghur muqams are now lauded as a “treasure trove,” “encyclopedia,” and “perfected” tradition raised from a “germ” over “two thousand years” by the Uyghurs as an “expression of their social and productive struggles” (Sai-fu-ding 1994: 45-46, 49, 51). The corpus of “folk classical” music (khelq klassik musikisi) has thus been apotheosized as the the unique, ancient and autochthonous tradition of Uyghur music now reconstructed nearly in its entirety and enshrined as one of the national musical forms of new China.

Despite the success of this program of ethnic cultural codification and representation, the Uyghur muqam still presents certain problems for PRC nationalist ideology, problems that arise from its Silk Road history. Muqam (variously spelled maqâm, mugham, and so forth) as both suite form and music theory belongs to a Arabo-Iranian-Turkic tradition that spans Central Asia, the Caucasus, Afghanistan, Iran, and the Arab countries (Chabrier 1960). Of the twelve names applied to the twelve standardized suites in Xinjiang today (Rak, Chebbiyat, Mushavrek, Chargah, Penjigah, Özhal, Ejem, Ushshaq, Bayat, Nava, Sigah, and Iraq), all but two are used elsewhere, and derive from Arabic and Persian, not Turkic language roots. Of the two used uniquely in Uyghur muqam, “Rak” may in fact be a derivation of an Arabic word, or even of the Indic raga, and Chebbiyat is a Turkicized
variation on another common Arab maqâm suite name, Bayat. Even the notion of specifically twelve muqam (the number twelve having zodiacal significance) appears earliest in the thirteenth century Arabic writings of Safî al-Dîn (Light 1998: 30-31). In Arab and Persian environments, maqâm refers to the musical modes of each suite, in which the pieces of a given suite are composed. Arab maqâm maintain the modes consistently; in Central Asia and Xinjiang in particular, the modes of pieces within the suites vary: they may begin and end in a particular mode, but middle pieces adhere only inconsistently (Light 1998: 28, 28 n. 19). (A mode is a particular order in which notes of a scale may be played. The muqams also use a wider variety of scales than the major, minor and harmonic minor scales most familiar in Western art music.)

Muqam, then, would thus seem to be the quintessential Silk Road musical form: variations on a theme stretching from the Tarim Basin to the Black Sea. The muqam scales, modes, rhythms, lyrics, instruments and terminology tie the Uyghurs to a system shared across the Islamic heartlands of Eurasia — but do not point to any obvious connections with Chinese musical tradition. Moreover, the fact that the Arab versions maintain consistent modality, while the Uyghur and other Central Asian ones do so only partially or nominally, would seem to indicate an Arab center for the tradition. (Maqâm literally means “place or rank” in Arabic, and is one of the standard terms used for mode in Arabo-Iranian music theory.)

Both Uyghur and Han politicians in China have worked to obviate these inconvenient implications. For example, in prefaces and keynote speeches delivered over decades on the subject of Uyghur muqam, Seypidin argued that muqam is originally a Uyghur word, corrupted by Persian and Arabic influences; he urged the cultivation of a “Uyghur Mukam-ology” that Uyghurizes relevant vocabulary.

This Chahetai language [Chaghatay is a literary written Turkic, with many Persian loan-words, that flourished from the fifteenth through nineteenth century in Central Asia] found its way into the terminology and poetry of the muqam, by way of the verses of the Maola [mullahs] [and] poets, during the Middle Ages. The result was that the Uighurs, creators of the muqam, could hardly understand the lyrics themselves. It is time that this mixed language of the muqam be cleansed of its impurities (Sai-fu-ding 1991: 72).

Chinese musicologists have joined the effort to de-emphasize the obvious transnational nature of muqam and its association with Islam, while playing up evidence of local origin and development, as well as links to and mutual influences with Chinese music. One approach has been to argue that the muqam began with the pre-Islamic Uyghurs. In his historical study of the on ikki muqam (1981), Abdushukur Muhemmet Imin suggests that the word “muqam” itself is originally Turkic and dates from the fourth century, well before it is attested in Arabic and before the Islamization of Central Asia. It was during the Karakhanid period in the eleventh century, Imin argues, that the muqam spread westward (Imin 1981; Trebinjac 2000: 228; Light 1998: 58-59). Zhou Jingbao sounds both Turkic and Chinese nationalistic notes, making a case for the influence of “Chinese” instruments and music — i.e., those of the Turks and of Quci (Kucha) — on Abbasid period Baghdad from the mid-eighth century. He points to five-string lutes in frescos at Kizil (near Kucha in Xinjiang) as evidence that the oud, the central instrument in Arab maqâm, was a Kucheans export. Moreover, he argues that al-Farabi (870-950), an author of musical treatises and, among other things, a famous commentary on Aristotle, was a Turk; likewise, Zhou suggests, Ibn Sina (Avicenna 980-1037), should be seen as “eastern” in his thinking and as a beneficiary of Turkic and Chinese influence in his musical theory because he was educated in Bukhara. Zhou’s logic is worth quoting:

In conclusion, the foundation of Ibn Sina’s thinking derives from al-Farabi, and Farabi was a Turk. Thus, there is no doubt that Ibn Sina’s theory enjoys Turkic influence. . . . Bukhara [where Ibn Sina lived as a youth] fell under the control of the Anxi Commandery (duhufl) and historical records illuminate the influence of Chinese culture on Bukhara. Because before he was 18 years old Ibn Sina lived in the Bukhara area, he unavoidably received the influence of Chinese civilization (Zhou 1987: 227).

In fact, the primary vehicle of the T’ang dynasty’s influence in Bukhara was its largely Turkic army. T’ang presence in Transoxiana was shortlived, and ended 230 years before Ibn Sina’s birth. Ibn Sina’s autobiography gives no suggestion of Chinese influence (Gohlman 1974).

Other arguments by PRC authors have likewise highlighted local roots and Chinese connections of the Uyghur muqam. Some scholars have noted structural and rhythmical similarities of the T’ang period suites known as daqu with
certain sub-sections of the muqam, and posited a common origin in the music of Kucha. Yin Falu goes further still, claiming that the suite form itself was originally introduced into the Tarim Basin by Chinese during the Han dynasty, to be thenceforth adopted by the people of Kucha, Kashgar, Turfan and so on as the basis of their own popular music.5

*Mukamology* (to use Seypidin's word) in China, then, has celebrated the Uyghur muqam as a unique cultural achievement of the Uyghur people, realized through a process of mutual interchange with the fraternal Han people. Links to the musical traditions of Central Asia, Iran and Arab lands which share the name muqam were by this argument merely one-way; they arose from the westward spread of Turkic and Uyghur musical culture and contributed significantly to the development of Arab music, providing, besides the muqam, certain scales and even the five-string lute or oud. On the other hand, according to this view the Arab and Persian literary and terminological influences that flowed back east with Islam represent an unfortunate corruption of the original purity of the Uyghur muqam.

This version of muqam history thus attempts to isolate the "folk classical" musical tradition of the Uyghurs from Central Asia and Islam, even while glorifying it. Where the links across the Pamirs are too obvious to ignore, they are dealt with by assigning creative priority to the Uyghurs. Of course, one can easily find examples of similar ideological approaches throughout official Uyghur historiography from the PRC, and the history of linguistic and script reforms of Xinjiang's Turkic languages is likewise one of consistent erection of orthographic barriers to communication among closely cognate languages and related peoples.

It is worth noting, however, that the PRC project to define, codify and develop the Uyghur Twelve Muqams is largely supported by Uyghurs, who appreciate the prestige it has afforded their national music. While some Uyghurs have presented Han musicians' borrowing and rewriting of Uyghur folk songs (Harris 2001), the muqam in its new redaction serves Uyghurs both within and outside of China as a proud symbol of Uyghur identity. And this course of history has been the common result of korenizatsiia across Central Asia: the cultural productions of Chinese and Soviet state cultural apparatus, however ersatz they may appear to western observers, have staying power as points of honor among the peoples whose identities they helped crystallize. Nationalist pride, as much as trans-national interchange, is part of the modern reality of the Silk Road.

**About the Author**

James A. Millward is Associate Professor of History and a member of the Edmund A. Walsh School of Foreign Service at Georgetown University. A specialist on Qing China and Inner Asia, he also teaches courses on "Steppe Empires and Silk Roads," and on "The Mongol World." His publications include *Beyond the Pass: Economy, Ethnicity and Empire in Qing Xinjiang, 1759-1864* (Stanford, 1998), the forthcoming Chinese Turkestan: a History of the Xinjiang Region (Hurst), contributions to the recent volume edited by S. Frederick Starr, *Xinjiang: China's Muslim Borderland* (Sharpe, 2004), and, for those who visit Kashgar, a fascinating article, "A Uyghur Muslim in Qianlong's Court: The Meanings of the Fragrant Concubine." *Journal of Asian Studies* 53:2 (1994).

**References**

Bentley and Ziegler 2003

Bovingdon 2004

Bulliet et al. 1997

Chabrier 1960

Farrell 1997

Gohlman 1974

Harris 2001

Imin 1981
Levin 1996

Light 1998

Ma 2002
Yo-Yo Ma and the Silk Road Ensemble, *Silk Road Journeys: When Strangers Meet* (Sony audio CD #89782, April 2002).

Mackerras 1985

Roy 2000

Sai-fu-ding 1991

Sai-fu-ding 1994

Smithsonian Institution 2002

Thrasher 2000

Trebinjac 1990

Trebinjac 2000

Wan 1959

Wan 1986

Zhou 1987

Zhou 1993

Notes
* I presented an earlier version of this paper at the Annual Meeting of the Association for Asian Studies in New York City, 29 March 2003. My thanks to Rachel Harris for furnishing me with bibliography and letting me read some of her not yet published work.

1. On the politics of Xinjiang historiography, see Bovingdon 2004.

2. Recently, official Chinese sources have started translating minzu as “ethnic group.”

3. Zhou 1987: 217-18, 224-227. A five-string lute is depicted in the cave frescos at Kizil (near Kucha) and listed in Tang sources as one of the Kuchean (Qiuci) instruments. However, such lutes with vaulted backs are common across Eurasia, and there are similar instruments depicted in Mediterranean sites dating from the second century BCE.

4. Avicenna’s *Canon* became the foundational work of Renaissance medicine in Europe.


Fig. 3. Playing a spike fiddle in Kashgar.
The Polychrome Rock Paintings in the Altay Mountains

Wang Binhua
Xinjiang Institute of Archaeology, Urumqi, China

The Altay Mountains, lying across the northern part of Xinjiang, played an important role in connecting Asia and Europe in ancient times. The cultural exchange passing through the Altay is but poorly known and thus merits scholarly investigation. Of particular interest is archaeological evidence, including polychrome rock paintings found in the caves of the Altay that have been reported in various channels in recent decades. These paintings, which provide valuable historical information, are the subject of this article.

Any kind of primitive culture must be closely associated with the natural environment in which it was created and developed. Before analyzing the rock paintings in the Altay Mountains, it is necessary to know a bit more about the mountains themselves. The Altay is a vast mountain system in Asia, straddling the administrative borders of four countries: Kazakhstan, China, Mongolia, and Russia (Fig. 1). In the territory of China is the south slope of its middle part, which runs through the northern border of Xinjiang from northwest to southeast, some 800 km in length and 80-150 km in width and with an average altitude of 3,000 m. Above 3,200 m is the glaciated area covered with heavy snow. From 3,200 m to 2,400 m is the high mountain belt of high-altitude pasture, supporting cattle in summer time. From altitude 2,400 m to 1,500 m is the middle mountain belt with good vegetation where there is plenty of rainfall and thus an ideal summer pasture. The low mountain belt, 1,500 m down to 1,000 m high, is a good grazing land in spring and autumn, where hills and gorges alternate and grass flourishes. Below 1,000 m, there are hills and sparse grazing ground. Winter grazing is found in the river valleys up against the mountain slopes and facing the sun. The mountain geography where water supply, vegetation and temperature vary with altitude makes possible a seasonal shift of grazing to provide better survival conditions and has made the Altay a base for the activity of the ancient pastoral nomads. Ever since the Neolithic Period it has provided the ancient nomads an ideal place for development as well as a continental bridge between the West and the East.

Evidence concerning ancient nomadic culture may be seen in abundant petroglyphs, often found in mountain pastures, along important routes of travel, in defiles and so on. Unlike the relatively well-known petroglyphs, which share the same spirit but have different representations and ages, the rock paintings are as yet little known and little studied.

It was in the summer of 1965 that I spotted the polychrome rock paintings in the caves of the Altay Mountains for the first time. As a member of the archaeological group of the History Research Institute of the Xinjiang Academy of Sciences, I was then doing archaeological research in the Altay area with the late Professor Yi Manbai and Mr. Wang Mingzhe. This trip lasted 5 months and covered thousands of kilometers. The cairns, stone coffins, deer-shaped steles, stone figures and rock carvings in both mountain and non-mountain areas were all very

Fig. 1. Northern Xinjiang and neighboring countries, with the Altay Mountains across the top center and right of picture.
impressive. Yet of these rich cultural remains, the rock paintings made the strongest impression. According to this incomplete personal research and some reports by colleagues, there are at least three sites in the Altay Mountains that have substantial numbers of polychrome rock paintings. In the area between the Haba River in the west and Altay City in the east, there are at least ten locations where such rock paintings may be seen. And this is only a preliminary estimate. The three sites with substantial numbers of the paintings are at Arktas in Altay City, Tangbaletas in Fuyun County, and Dugat in Haba River County.

Rock paintings in the caves at Arktas

"Arktas," which in Turkish means "white rocks," is about 23 km northwest of Altay City in the township of Balibagai. Geographically, it lies in a long gap in granite rocks at an altitude of 1000m. The cave with rock paintings is a natural shallow groove in the middle part of the granite, 13 m long, 1-4 m deep and 1.3-1.5 m high. The cave faces south onto open grassland, where there is a slowly-flowing brook. In this long narrow granite cave, five groups of paintings may be made out.

1) Near the entrance is an image of vulvae in reddish brown pigment, oval shaped, 16 cm in length and 7 cm in width, with a small hole in the center. Fifty short paralleled lines can be seen above the vulvae; below is a curved line like the contour of a buttock.

2) Further down are four geometric images of human beings, with 40 short parallel lines beside them. The images are 13-17 cm high, all with raised hands and separated legs.

3) At the very end of the cave is a long belt of many short parallel lines, below which is a human image, 16 cm high, with raised hands and separated legs.

4) On the huge rock walls at the entrance are images of five cattle and one horse. The cattle are very stocky and all are in a running posture. The horns of three stretch ahead and the horns of the other two bend backward. The largest of the cattle (86 cm long, 55 cm high) is at the end, the smallest (31 cm long, 23 cm high) at the front. It seems that the painter had good sense of distance and perspective. Below the cattle is a quite skillful depiction of a horse (66 cm long, 40 cm high) with a raised head and running legs. The images were created in a kind of "mixed technique," since the contours of the cattle and horse were once chiseled and the grooves filled with reddish brown pigment.

5) In addition to these images, on the huge rock walls at the entrance, there is one goat with big horns in reddish brown. The goat stands with high raised head and horns.

In addition to the better-preserved rock paintings in the cave at Arktas, the Altay City region has other remains of rock paintings at Glashihalahai and Kirlmuqiyuitas. However, the images are too faint for identification; infrared photography may be needed to decipher them.

Rock paintings in the caves at Tangbaletas.

"Tangbaletas," which means "painted rocks" in Turkish, is located in Tangbaletas Village, Kelabulegen Town, 60 km north in Fuyun County (in Kazakh it is called "Keketuhai," meaning green forest). Two painted caves were found there.

- **Cave 1**, at the mid-mountain side, 25 m higher than the inhabited village. The cave is high and spacious (20 m wide, 11.5 m high and 11.8 m deep, width gradually contracts down toward the end) and can easily contain dozens of people and not seem crowded. The cave faces southeast, receiving plenty of light, with a view down along a slope covered with thick, verdant grass. The higher location of the cave and the grass-covered slope in front of the cave make it an ideal gathering place for the ancient inhabitants of the area to engage in religious rituals. (Fig. 2)

Rock paintings can be seen at the cave’s top and side walls. On the top, at a distinctive position is a geometric symbol (Fig. 3, next page). The images on the right side look like two human faces with peaked caps. For one
face, there are dense parallel short lines, and below the lines are three diamond-shaped graphics like the Chinese character ping, resembling the eyes and nose. For the other one, there are dense parallel short lines at the position of its chin. (Figs. 4, 5, 6) These two human faces with caps are quite big, one being 72 cm high, the other 170 cm high. On the façade of the cave are 4 giant ovals with smaller circles inside, which are in white or dark purple in contrast to the reddish brown background. The long diameters of the 4 ovals are respectively 70 cm, 80 cm, 49 cm and 120 cm. (Fig. 7, next page). Given the fact that these vulvae-like ovals are big, positioned at the center and are painted in heavy colors, they were probably the main subject of the overall composition. The painting is weird and unique, like sketches lacking any concrete image, the effect being to create a mystical atmosphere. Of religious and shamanic significance, such paintings may help us further understand prehistoric religions. This impression is reinforced by a palm image, with 3 oval images below on the left side of the cave. This image shares the cultural spirit of the other paintings in the cave which may be associated with worship for birthing ability.

- Cave 2, located only 60m away from Cave 1 in the same granite cluster, is relatively small. Its paintings are simpler than those in Cave 1 – just some drawings of foxes, boars and deer in reddish brown.

Rock paintings in the caves at Dugat.

Dugat is in Salbulak Town, Haba River County, where the protruding granite has eroded over the millennia into uniquely-shaped hills containing strangely-shaped caves resembling honeycombs or dwellings. In contrast below the hills is a totally different landscape of rippling streams and flourishing grass, full of vitality. This unusual environment has a strong visual impact, which is an ideal venue for prehistoric religious rituals. Seven groups of polychrome paintings were found in the caves and lines spread across an area 126 cm high and 130 cm wide. The upper part shows eight people in two rows with something like weapons; on one end is a graphic consisting of two rows of parallel vertical lines. The lower part shows three groups of triangle-like images of...
mountains, below which are three men in peaked caps. In between the two parts is a group of unknown graphics composed of short red lines.

- **Cave 3**, with a 1.7 m-wide entrance and measuring 1.5 m high and 1.3 m deep, has on its left lower wall a cow painted in reddish brown, below which is a stout man with a peaked cap, two arms hanging down. On the right upper wall is a claval [keylike?] object. In between are many geometrical graphics, the middle group of which, composed of short lines, can be identified as a mouth. The rest of the graphics are all in thick dots and vertical lines, which seem quite unusual and mystic.

- **Cave 4**, a rather small cave with a 1 m-high entrance, height of 0.8 m and depth of 0.9 m, has a row of stick-like lines painted in dark reddish brown filling an area of 3-4 cm high and 65 cm long and resembling a fence.

- **Cave 5**, with a 1 m-high entrance, height of 0.8 m, depth of less than 1 m, contains two dancing people painted in reddish brown.

- **Cave 6**, another small cave, with entrance width 1 m, height 0.5 m and depth 1 m, contains paintings of a man and two cattle. The man is about 26 cm high, with a two-horned head ornament, his arms stretching ahead and standing splay-footed. Limited by the cave size in the front part, there are two half-bodied animals’ contours outlined in reddish brown.

- **Cave 7**, the most spacious cave in Dugat, is 20 m above the bottom of its cliff. The entrance is 8 m wide and the interior 2.8 m high and 4.5 m deep. Paintings were found at the façade, covering an area of 2.5 x 4.5 m². This grand painting is a rather complicated one of what appears to be a hunting scene. The upper, lower and left side of the painting are full of hand and foot prints, fences and traps composed of short paralleled vertical lines. On the right side of the painting some people were driving cattle and horses forward in this entrapment. Some animals have already been killed by spears; four or five cattle and horses were lying on the ground. The size of the people is much smaller than that of the big animals. In addition to the people driving animals from the back, there is another man holding a shield and a spear, facing the animals in the front. On the far right side of the painting, there are also some people standing spread out as if they are waiting for the prey to come. (Fig. 7)

How might we interpret the Altay paintings? As we can see from the attached photographs, apart from the clearly identifiable images of animals, human beings, and hand and foot prints, most images are symbolic geometric graphics consisting of parallel lines, ovals, triangles and figures composed of short lines. Those graphics must have meant something to the painters thousands of years ago, although for us the graphics seem to represent myths we need to decode. There seem to be several themes.

1. **Worship for birthing ability**

On this theme, the typical example is the Arktas rock painting which is simple and almost realistically drawn, enabling us to figure out the painter’s purpose. The curve under the centered vulvae image outlines the buttocks, and the short lines above resembles pubic hair, which also symbolizes pasture land and earth. This can be regarded as an abstract depiction of vulvae, but one not too far from reality. Phallism was
common at the primitive stage of human society. And worship for birthing ability was an early form of phalism which represents the primitive people’s religious belief in women’s mystic power of reproduction during the period of matriarchal society. At this early stage of human society when interactive magic was believed in as a means to get divine blessings, primitive people believed that everything had a spirit, and that the reproduction of population was associated with the fertility of earth and the flourishing of pasture. This can be proven by much anthropologic evidence worldwide which shows that childbirth, mothering, earth and life are connected with each other. Therefore, the vulvae image and the curve below it and the short lines above it painted at Arktas actually expressed people’s wish for population reproduction and prayers for abundant harvest and flourishing pastures.

Using the vulvae and grassland image of the Arktas rock paintings helps us to interpret the Tangbaletas paintings located not far away from Arktas. The complicated images in this huge cave are composed of the following 3 components:

- A geometric mark on the top center.
- Four distinctive oval images on the façade wall. These ovals that occupied the most important position on the wall obviously represent vulvae too.
- Human faces with peaked caps on the top right wall. According to the many folklore documents, we can infer that those human face images represent shamans. “Longsha Ji Lue” by Fan Shiji (Qing period) says that “Wizards who connect with gods are called shamans. They wear caps like funnels.” In the mind of the ancient Altay nomads, the human faces with funnel-shaped caps in the rock paintings must have been images of shamans. The belief in shamans appeared very early among the ancient nomads of northern Eurasia. For the ancient nomads, they mediated between the visible and spirit worlds. The nomads believed that through the shamans’ magic, they could be blessed by gods and obtain their wishes such as reproduction of people and cattle, escaping diseases and disasters, maintaining peace and safety, etc. As a result, the images of shamans and vulvae of this cave’s painting show the aboriginal people’s prayers for their women to have stronger birthing ability. Shamans had powers different from those of normal people. They were the medium where gods made their presence. The mysterious caves were then naturally regarded as the residence of gods, and therefore the ideal place for magic rituals.

2. Encircled Hunting.

In the life of the ancient nomads, large-scale encircled hunting was an important way of production. In the early days, the target of hunting was normally those big yet clumsy vegetarians like cattle and horses rather than fierce beasts. The painting in Dugat cave is a picture of exactly this kind of hunting: At least 3 bloody cattle lay on the ground, shot by spears; another five cattle and horses remained standing but had been struck by spears and were under attack. Some of the people in this picture hold triangular shields, some hold clubs, some are even disguised as beasts. One should note that there are no bows and arrows in the painting. Around the hunting scene are patterns composed of parallel red lines, arcs and triangles; and many hand and foot prints, which means the victory would belong to the hunters. Except for the small number of geometric figures that we are not able to explain, the theme of the painting is quite clear: it was a record of or a prayer for a successful hunt.

It reflects the same theme as in the hunting scenes of the rock paintings of the Paleolithic Period found in western Europe. The only difference is that the Paleolithic paintings of hunting found in France and Spain are more vivid and objective, while the Altay rock paintings are generally clumsy, their images are mainly line-drawn and in particular the images of animals are quite simple. Moreover, the abstract marks could be regarded as a regional feature of the Altay rock paintings.

3. Social conflicts.

The painting in Dugat Cave No. 2 may reflect the social conflict at that time and the painter’s celebration for the winning party. The two groups of people separated by many parallel lines are totally different in mood and posture. One group has eight people, holding weapons and looking to be in high spirits. The three people of the other group, two of them wearing peaked caps, have their arms hanging down and are obviously in the inferior position. We can feel the painter’s emotions expressed in the painting regarding whom he supported and for whom he celebrated. Blocked off by three high mountains and grassland, the two parties could hardly ever meet.


There are a lot of abstract geometric symbols, primarily triangles, parallel lines, fence-like patterns, oval-shaped curves composed of red dashes or semicircular curves. The curves are not completely closed; all have a gap, which makes them look like traps. Other symbols including claval shapes, dense dots, hand- and footprints, etc. Most of the
symbols were drawn with great care and were obviously arranged with some purpose. So far it is impossible to decode their meaning and cultural significance, but undoubtedly those symbols were once blessed by magic and in the painter's view therefore possessed supernatural force.

The Altay paintings are also a precious resource for us to study primitive magic rituals. For primitive peoples, all the important events related to the clan's survival and development needed to be blessed, and magic was the very way to reach the gods. As a result of extensive scientific observation, the British anthropologist Malinowski concluded that magic is practiced in situations where it causes emotions to oscillate between hope and fear. Primitive people faced challenges which they felt were beyond human control and thus could only be addressed by magic: such things as reproduction of the clan's population, ensuring a favorable result of the actual hunt; the real animals. When animals were struck in the paintings, they were believed to interconnect with the real animals. When animals were struck in the paintings, they were believed to interconnect with the real animals. When animals were struck in the paintings, they were believed to interconnect with the real animals. When animals were struck in the paintings, they were believed to interconnect with the real animals. They faced problems which they were unable to solve, moving clumsily, and thus easier to hunt. Once such an animal was caught, it could feed a number of people for several days. Compared with the hunting scenes of the Paleolithic Age rock paintings found in France and Spain, there were quite a few similarities. But age-wise, the Altay rock paintings were a bit later, which explains the appearance of some abstract graphics.

The Second important basis for the proposed dating is that the hunters do not use arrows and bows. The invention and use of arrows and bows was a great achievement of the period of primitive society and a vital
indication of the end of the Paleolithic Age and the beginning of the Neolithic Age. In the Altay Mountain area, there are rock carvings at more than 80 sites, and at each site there are anywhere from a dozen to more than one hundred pictures. Hunting activities are a very common subject, and the weapons most used were arrows and bows. Art originated from life. The very different hunting way of the Altay rock paintings reveals that the creator of those paintings still had no idea about arrows and bows: what they knew was to surround the prey by several bows: what they knew was to encircle hunting and the absence of arrows and bows, the evidence of the paintings regarding worship for birthing ability was also a dominant thought of the Paleolithic Age.

Just as with the depiction of encircled hunting and the absence of arrows and bows, the evidence of the paintings of the Altay rock paintings reveals that the creator of those paintings still had no idea about arrows and bows: what they knew was to surround the prey by several people and use spears as their weapons. That means they had not yet entered the new Neolithic age.

There is some additional evidence to support a date in the Paleolithic. The existence of Paleolithic human remains in this area is a precondition to the discovery of rock paintings dated 10,000 years ago. Although no Paleolithic remains have yet been discovered in the Altay Mountains within China’s territory due to limited archaeological work in Xinjiang, such remains do exist if we extend to the whole mountain system. A few Paleolithic remains have been found in the Altay Mountains of Russian Siberia, for example the Wulalinka River Paleolithic Age habitation in Alnor-Altest city dating 15,000 years ago, and Stelanaya Paleolithic dwelling cave remains in the Altay Geekiliek Mountain area, etc. These Paleolithic remains provide a basis for us to analyze the rock paintings with the Paleolithic-style culture which we have discovered so far in the Altay area. We note as well that in the territory of the Mongolian Republic, east of Xinjiang, similar reddish brown rock paintings have been found in the caves in the Hoytsaikel River Valley, which is part of the Altay Mountain system. The reports indicate that “The rock paintings were drawn in reddish-brown tone and consisted of 13 groups, distributed on the roof and walls in the cave. The animals’ contours were drawn with pigments; the depictions included oxen, goats, animals with tusks, and birds very much like an ostrich.” Though not all the images are the same as those in the Altay rock paintings in Xinjiang, part of the description (for example “The animals’ contours were drawn with pigments; the depictions included oxen”) is quite similar, suggesting that the Mongolian discoveries would be useful reference material for us to further analyze the rock painting remains at Haba River and Fuyun County in the Altay area.

Therefore, we are quite certain that the polychrome rock paintings in the Xinjiang Altay are remains of the late Paleolithic Age. They are a valuable art legacy that could be traced as far back as 10,000 years ago. This conclusion is significant for the archaeology of Xinjiang where to date we have very limited Paleolithic findings and still lack knowledge of the early civilization of Xinjiang in the primitive period. The paintings themselves are very helpful in studying that Paleolithic culture. What’s more, it’s very likely other remains from the Paleolithic Age will be found nearby. If we follow the clues to carry out focused surveys, we may make a breakthrough in the archaeological research on the Paleolithic Age.

Furthermore, those paintings provide valuable specimens for us to study the thinking patterns, phallic beliefs, magic and hunting activities of the early humans and to understand the creation and feature of primitive art work. The paintings demonstrate that even primitive art creation was driven by substantial need and served a practical purpose connected with gaining material benefit.

Since the eighteen century in countries of Western Europe such as France and Spain, more than 100 rock-painting sites have been discovered, most of them hidden in the deep end of pathless caves. They depict in reddish-brown or black drawing animals like buffaloes and horses being killed by spears and date from 15,000 - 40,000 years ago. We can see a lot of similarities with the paintings in the Xinjiang Altay. Both there and in the European caves, we see big animals drawn in reddish-brown pigments or outlined by colored lines, and being hunted with spears. Beyond the mere fact of these similarities, we might have here evidence to suggest some connections and communications long ago across Eurasia. Going west from the Altay through the Kazakh hills and Turan lowlands, one can easily reach the European plain. Going east, one can reach the Kobdo area of the Mongolian Republic. The continuous mountains which are transport barriers today used to be linking bridges for the ancient nomads in ancient times. The Sogdians, Xiongnu, Xianbei, Turks, and Mongolians who once dominated the great prairie had moved around through the inland gateway of Altay. As a result, the Altay Mountains with their rich resources, which stretch all the way from east to west, had long ago become an ideal route for the ancient nomads in the northern Eurasia. This is convincing evidence of the ancient “Silk Road in the Prairie” which had no documented proof but did exist in ancient times. The evidence discussed here is part of the first chapter in the history of the prairie civilization in
Eurasia which still lacks in-depth research and thus deserves more attention and efforts by fellow archaeologists.

**About the Author**

**Wang Binghua** is one of China's most distinguished archaeologists, Director of the Xinjiang Institute of Archaeology, and Director of the new Silk Road Museum in Urumqi. He is an authority on the early history of the peoples of Xinjiang. Among his many publications are:


---

**Viticulture and Viniculture in the Turfan Region**

**Xinru Liu**  
*The College of New Jersey*  
*Ewing, N. J.*

In early July 2004 I made a short trip to Turfan. The people there were warm, friendly, extremely hospitable and love dancing and drinking. Although they are good Muslims, drinking is a part of their way of life.¹ Our guide, Dr. Julaiti, a Uyghur ophthalmologist, repeatedly advised us to enjoy wine with our hosts for otherwise, he said, "they would be angry!” He further informed me that Muslims in Turfan not only drank, but also performed religious rituals somewhat differently than Muslims of other regions. There is, he continued, a slight Buddhist flavor in their ritual performances and music. As Dr. Julaiti is a scholar and seasoned traveler of many Islamic countries, I trust his judgment. In fact, it is not at all surprising that there are some Buddhist survivals in Turfan since this was the predominant religion of the country in earlier centuries. This raises the interesting question of whether Buddhists in ancient Turfan drank alcoholic beverages?

The obvious answer, of course, is no; Buddhists are not supposed to drink. The Turfan region is well known for its viticulture, but not necessarily for its wine. Dotting the landscape are numerous shelters used for drying grapes to make raisins; the current winery of the region is a recent phenomenon following French techniques and tastes. However, the people of Turfan often prefer distilled grain alcohol to grape wine. In short, even though there is a long tradition of viticulture, or grape cultivation, viniculture, the making of wine and its associated culture and rituals, may not be an ancient tradition in Turfan.

However, current conditions and common sense cannot answer historical questions, especially for the oases along the Central Asian Silk Road. Turfan and Dunhuang, the gate to the Chinese interior, have preserved many historical documents, some of which indicate that viticulture began there in Han times and developed into a mature viniculture by the T’ang. Moreover, this development was linked to the spread of Buddhism into this region.

Viticulture is as ancient as agriculture. Recent research traces wine back to the Neolithic period. Egypt, Mesopotamia and the Holy Land all had their wine drinking traditions. Viticulture reached its apex in the ancient world in the Greco-Roman era where grape cultivation, wine making, and special drinking paraphernalia were encased in a complex set of rituals, and where the Dionysus-Bacchus cult made drinking an essential component of public festivals [McGovern 2003; Unwin 1991: 94-133]. In the Mediterranean world, wine was an important sector of the economy and was extensively and widely traded. But this is not the case of East Asia or even the eastern part of Central Asia. Ancient Chinese did drink alcohol, but this was produced from fermented food grains. As for Turfan and the Central Asian oases, they had to wait for the introduction of advanced irrigation technology that made the
cultivation of the vine feasible in this arid environment. Therefore, viticulture and eventually viniculture came with the elaboration of the Silk Road.

Zhang Qian probably brought knowledge of viticulture to China. But only after General Li Guangli made his expeditions to Dawan (Fergana) and obtained the “heavenly horses” did Han Wudi sent missions back to Dawan to procure seeds of alfalfa and the grape for China. According to Hanshu, the Han History, Wudi made this decision because there were many heavenly horses to feed and many foreign envoys to be entertained [Ban Gu 1964: 96a/3895]. In this he was following the practice of ancient Iran and neighboring regions such as western Central Asia where alfalfa was important in breeding and feeding high quality horses. At the same time Wudi obtained the alfalfa from Dawan, he became aware of the viticulture of that region [Lauffer 1967: 208-245]. In this period, around 100 BCE, Dawan and Afghanistan, then under the control of the Yuezhi-Kushans, already had a mature viticulture. Elites stored large quantities of wine which could last for several decades before it soured [Ban Gu 1964: 96a/3894]. However, there is no indication that the Han Chinese made wine out the grapes.

Meanwhile, the Han government took measures to protect the trade routes extending from the oases of Central Asia through the Hexi Corridor between the Qilian Mountains and the Gobi Desert. Wudi had a line of garrison towns built in Hexi Corridor, and the Great Wall extended to the Jade Gate and to the western most of these garrison towns, Dunhuang. To establish a military presence in the frontier and to ease the problem of transporting food grains to these remote areas, the Han government imple-mented the tuntian system which placed garrisons around the watch towers and in well-irrigated agricultural colonies. Thus, the soldiers in the frontier could cultivate the land during the periods of peace. The Han government soon extended the tuntian system beyond the Jade Gate, with Turfan as one of its major headquarters. As Turfan controlled the lines of communications between the Western Region and the Chinese interior, this garrison, called Wuji Jiaowei, was the center of all military-agricultural colonies beyond the Jade Gate. Though Han government did not always control the Western Region, agriculture developed rapidly in all the oases, thanks to the profit of the passing trade and the introduction of irrigation technology. After a couple of hundreds year, the region from Dunhuang to Turfan became a fertile land growing food grains, mulberries for silk, hemp, and grape. Because of its strategic location and agricultural riches, the Han government stationed garrisons and tuntian headquarters wherever possible and strenuously fought the Xiongnu for control of the region [Fan Ye 1965: 88/2914]. In consequence, viticulture along with sericulture reached Turfan by the first or the second centuries, the time of the Later Han.

It is during this period that the volume of trade along the Silk Road accelerated. In Palmyra, the caravan city in Syria desert and a principal trading depot of the eastern Roman frontier, many pieces of Han silk textiles have been recovered from tombs, striking testimony to the fact that Han China and the Mediterranean world were commercially linked by the Silk Road. However, not all these silks were necessarily produced in the Han territory inside the Great Wall. A polychrome silk of compound weave from Palmyra depicts camels under a vineyard [Kat. 240 in Schmidt-Colinet 2000, Tafel 96, 97]. This unique piece has attracted the notice of scholars, and Elfriede Regina Knauer, among others, believes it was made in Turfan [Knauer 1998: 111n92]. I agree with Knauer’s judgment, not only because viticulture was established in Turfan during the Later Han, but also because of the presence there of sericulture. If this is the case, it is not only viticulture that reached Turfan but also a new industry and element of material culture worthy expressed in this exquisite silk textile.

The next question is whether viniculture accompanied grape cultivation to Turfan and other Central Asian oases. As mentioned above, when Han China brought in grape cultivation, viticulture and viniculture were already well established in the western part of Central Asia, that is, in the regions of modern day northern Afghanistan and Uzbekistan. Moreover, because yeast for fermentation naturally occurs in grape skins, the transition to wine making in the oases of eastern Central Asian seems an easy and obvious step. This, however, did not happen in the Han period.

Viniculture in northern Afghanistan and Uzbekistan developed under Hellenistic influence. Starting in the later fourth century BCE, Greek colonists brought in vineyards, wine making, drinking vessels and other aspects of the Dionysian festivals. After nomadic peoples took over Hellenistic Bactria, viniculture persisted and flourished under the Kushan Empire. During the first couple centuries CE when the Kushan Empire also flourished, thanks to the expansion of the Silk Road trade passing through its territory, the center of Buddhist activity migrated from the lower Ganges to northwest region of South Asia and Afghanistan, the core territory of the Kushans. Greco-Roman influence, including
viniculture, is well expressed in Gandharan Buddhist art. Amphorae, craters, goblets and all kinds of vessels used in Dionysus-Bacchus festivals appear in the many drinking scenes in stone sculptures associated with Buddhist monuments and shrines. The motifs of grapes and grape vines in these bacchanalian scenes indicate that the beverage depicted was grape wine.

The Buddhist institutions and practices developed in the Kushan era then spread to Central Asia and China. Unfortunately, there is a dearth of Chinese information concerning the Western Region after the collapse of the Han central power. Archaeological finds indicate the Silk Road trade continued, and so did the development of viticulture, probably also viniculture. When the Western Region finally emerged from the darkness, Turfan, now called Gaochang in the Chinese records, is a countryside famous for grape wine, in addition to its millets, wheat, sericulture and many varieties of fruit. People there worshipped a number of local gods but also adhered to Buddhism [Wei Zheng et al. 1973: 83/1847]. The Gaochang state survived the Sui Dynasty, but was conquered by the T’ang. The history of the T’ang, written in the Song Dynasty, repeats the enumeration of the local products, but adds a new item, cotton [Liu Xu 1975: 198/5294]. Native to India, cotton reached Turfan as a cultivated crop in the post-Han and pre-T’ang period, along with viniculture and Buddhism.

The final question is did the Buddhist population of Turfan drink wine? At various times, Central Asia people have been followers of Buddhism, Manichaism, and Islam, all of which formally ban the consumption of alcohol. However, despite such prohibitions, they regularly drank wine for centuries. For example, while Manichaean doctrine banned alcohol, their monasteries in Qocho nonetheless produced wine.2 It is likely that Buddhists behaved similarly. There is no direct evidence of wine-drinking among Buddhists in Turfan, but there is abundant evidence that wine-drinking was a common practice of Buddhists living on the Tang frontier, particularly in Dunhuang. A large number of manuscripts from Dunhuang generated by lay Buddhist societies (sheyi) document their establishment, regulations, etc. A special kind of document, called a Shesi Zhuantie, announcing Buddhist festivals, social events and business meetings, was circulated among members of lay Buddhist organizations. Almost all of these notices include a statement concerning the punishment for tardiness and absence: “Each of those who are late should pay the fine of one horn of wine, and of those who do not come at all should pay the fine of half a jar of wine, to the group. The wine will be divided among all the members.” Fines of the same type also appear in regulations for lay societies [Ning Ke and Hao Chunwen 1997]. No doubt wine played an indispensable role in both social and religious activities of Buddhism. But these announcements never mention the kind of wine involved; they simply use the character jiu, the generic term for alcoholic beverage.

Jiu also appears frequently as an item in accounts of monastic expenditures, some of which have survived in the famous caves of the Mogao Grottos, in Dunhuang. Buddhist monasteries provided oil, food grains and wine (jiu) for the Spring festivals, Autumn festivals, and parades of Buddha images. All the participants, members of lay societies and monks, enjoyed the food and wine. There were also many other occasions when the monasteries had to provide food and wine, sometimes only for monks, sometimes for visitors and the artisans working there. It seems that the monasteries of Dunhuang stored oil and food grains, but paid for wine with their food grains. Two different verbs are used to express “buying wine”: gujiu, and wojiu. The former is a straightforward phrase “to buy wine,” but the meaning of the latter is unclear. Probably due to this ambiguity, some scholars insist that the wines used in Buddhist festivals were made from grain. If the term wojiu meant to make wine with the allotted wheat or millet, then the wine was fermented from food grain like traditional Chinese wine. However, as the food grain was allotted for immediate use, festival banquets or meals for workers, this seems most unlikely. For instance, an account of expenditure of Jingtu Monastery in Dunhuang, dated in the period 936-947, notes that some millet was spent for both gujiu and wojiu, for the purpose of a forthcoming festival [ibid.: 774; Pelliot 2032 back]. An account dated in 991 for the same monastery list millets paid for the principal of wine (jiubensu) [Ibid.: 777; Pelliot 4907]. Here the character ben could either be the capital for investment in trading wine, or the millet used for making wine. However, millet is a better source for vinegar than for wine. In China, since ancient times, the most common materials for fermenting wine have been rice and sorghum. In Dunhuang, during the T’ang and post-T’ang period, millet, sometimes wheat, was currency for payment of goods. On the same account, millet was used to pay for activities of lay societies such as printing Buddha images. Millet and wheat were local agricultural products, but rice and sorghum were not. Thus in this case, the millet is most likely the payment for grape wine. In short, one
cannot exclude the possibility that the Buddhists in Dunhuang, lay persons and monks, drank grape wine. There was no reason why the residents of Dunhuang could not have obtained the well known grape wine of Turfan a short distance to their west.

Evidently, Buddhists in Dunhuang drank wine during the T’ang time, and Turfan was famous for producing grape wine. Based on these two facts, one may speculate that during the T’ang times Buddhists, lay persons and monks, enjoyed grape wine at many festivals and social occasions. This reminds us of one of the famous lines on frontier military life by the T’ang poet Li Bo:

Holding a glowing goblet filled with grape wine,
Following the melody of a lute, I am about to drink,
The neighing horse urges me to ride on him.
Do not laugh if you see me lying drunk on the battle field,
Few soldiers ever came back from the military expeditions, anyway.

Li Bo did not actually serve on the western frontier region of the T’ang Empire. His poem simply evokes romanticized picture of the frontier life: music played on lute, neighing horses ready to depart, and soldiers dinking grape wine to pluck up their courage for coming battle and death.

The wines of Turfan retained their fame well into the Mongolian era. The Mongols were used to wine made from mare’s milk, but quickly acquired a taste for grape wine after their conquest of Central Asia. Marco Polo mentioned that Carachoco, the name of Turfan of his time, produced good wine and corn (millet) [Polo 1938: 156]. The famous scholar of the Il-Khans, Rashid al-Din, notes that Qara-Khocho was a town of Uyghurs and produced good wine [Rashid al-Din 1971: 286]. The wine of Turfan was so well known that the official history of the Mongol Yuan Dynasty records the tribute of grape wine (putao jiu) from there [Yuanshi 1978: Ch. 34, p. 755, line 2]. This means that the high quality of Turfan wine was known across the continent and thus, at the time, it was probably the best known vintage in the world. The peoples of Turfan, whether Buddhists or Muslims, always seem to enjoy wine. The current viniculture of there, though now integrated with the global market, has deep roots in history.

About the Author
A specialist on Ancient India and cross-cultural trade in ancient and medieval Asia, Professor Xinru Liu teaches in the Department of History at the College of New Jersey, Ewing, N.J. She is well known for her two major books, Ancient India and Ancient China: Trade and Religious Exchanges, AD 1-600 (Oxford University Press, 1988; reprinted 1994) and Silk and Religion: an Exploration of Material Life and the Thought of People, AD 600-1200 (Oxford University Press, 1999) and has written a short introduction to the Silk Road for the American Historical Association (The Silk Road: Overland Trade and Cultural Interactions in Eurasia, 1998). She may be contacted at liuxinru@msn.com.

References
Ban Gu 1964
Fan Ye 1965
Jarring 1993
Knauer 1998
Lauffer 1967
Lieu 1985
Liu Xu et al. 1975
McGovern 1991
Ning Ke, Hao Chunwen 1997
Nanfeng: Jiayu guji chubanshe, 1997
Polo 1938
Rashid al-Din 1971
Schmidt-Colinet et al. 2000
Unwin 1991
Wei Zheng et al. 1973
Notes

1. The Koran bans wine drinking as a great sin, but promised Muslims wine in Paradise. Under Islamic rule, viticulture suffered at the early stage of conquest, but recovered by the eleventh century. See Unwin 1991: 150-155. As for eastern Turkistan, namely today’s Xinjiang Autonomous Region of China, grape wine was produced, but drinking was held in contempt as immoral behavior in the early twentieth century. See Jarring 1993: 1, 13.

2. For a Manichaean monastery with wine, see Lieu 1985: 200-201.

Chinese Characters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chinese Characters</th>
<th>Pinyin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>gujiu</td>
<td>沽酒</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jiu</td>
<td>酒</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jiubensu</td>
<td>酒本粟</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shesi Zhuantie</td>
<td>社司转帖</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sheyi</td>
<td>社邑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wojiu</td>
<td>酗酒</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Southern Xinjiang as seen from a NASA satellite.
Annotated Bibliography of the History and Culture of Eastern Turkistan, Jungharia/Zungaria/Dzungaria, Chinese Central Asia, and Sinkiang/Xinjiang (for the 16th-20th centuries CE, excluding most travel narratives)

Nathan Light
Miami University
Oxford, Ohio

Introduction

The study of Eastern Turkistan or Xinjiang has long been hampered by geographic, cultural and linguistic complexity and difficult access to publications, but over the past 500 years, an enormous range of documentary materials have accumulated. Many Europeans have explored and studied the region since 1850 but their publications are often appear only in major research libraries and special collections, and even the travel accounts rarely reach a wider audience. Eastern Turkistan’s scholarly and strategic importance has resulted in extensive publications in European and East Asian languages, particularly Russian, German, French, English, Chinese and Japanese. In addition, authors from the region and from other parts of the Islamic world have written literary, historiographic and religious works in Arabic, Persian and Turki, while Chinese travelers and colonial officials have also left extensive descriptions, particularly since the Manchu-Qing conquest in 1758 CE.

As a part of the “Silk Road,” this region has been the conduit for people, culture and commerce since before recorded history. Much of the region’s fame has arisen from the extensive archeological and documentary finds in the arid southern and eastern Xinjiang regions as well as nearby Dunhuang in Gansu, but Xinjiang’s populated oases and steppe continue to sustain its role as a region through which travelers and traders link East, Central and South Asian spiritual, literary and material cultures. Before the name Xinjiang was applied in 1884, the Chinese described it as Xiyu (“Western Regions”) or Huijiang (“Muslim territories”) while Central Asians called it Kashgaria, Altishahr or Yettishahr (6 or 7 cities) or Eastern Turkistan. All of these names have acquired political meanings in the present, with the Chinese government strongly attacking the term Eastern Turkistan as a sign of separatist and even terrorist leanings. The widespread Chinese concern about this term can be seen from a search at Google.com: using Chinese characters for Dongtu (“Eastern Turkistan”) gives over one million hits, more than for either of the Chinese terms used for the Silk Road (Sizhouzhilu or Silu) and not far behind the 1.7 million hits for the name Xinjiang itself.

My goal in this bibliography is to introduce the study of the region through a classified list of the basic materials for study of culture and history over the past 500 years. The “Silk Road” is often described as in decline during this period, but in fact more recent Islamic and Mongol history is every bit as culturally rich and diverse as the preceding period, although the sources have not been as widely accessible to Western scholars. In compiling the present bibliography I found works remaining difficult to access: items such as publications by Pantusov from 1880-1910 are only slightly more available in research library collections than more recent publications from Xinjiang. Useful material exists in dissertations, obscure serial publications or unpublished conference papers. Not very different from the latter are the many rare manuscripts held in collections around the world, which fortunately are now slowly being edited and published, although with less fanfare than the Dunhuang and Tarim region texts from earlier periods. As these become more accessible these materials will considerably deepen our understanding of the history and culture of Eastern Turkistan: similar results can be seen arising from recent use of Manchu language sources for the study of Qing China and Turkic and Persian sources for Central Asia. This bibliography should improve access and help guide future library cataloging of items in Central Asian languages.

Outline of Contents

I) Online Databases and Information Sources (all periods)
II) Selected Historical Background to 1500 CE and Regional Reference Works
III) Collected Works
IV) Serial publications
V) Bibliographies and Manuscript Descriptions

28
VI) Historical and Hagio-
graphical Primary Sources
VII) Studies of History
VIII) World History, Interna-
tional Relations and Manchu-
Junghar Interactions
IX) Western Explorers, 
Missionaries, and Consuls 
(excluding travel accounts not 
related to formal expeditions)
X) Basic Sources for 
Linguistics and Language Study
XI) Studies of Literature 
and Literary History
XII) Performing Arts, Ethno-
musicology, Folklore, Folk Art, 
Architecture and Material 
Culture
XIII) Anthropology, Cultural 
Analysis, Ethnography, Ethnicity, 
Ethnogenesis
XIV) Religion: Islam, Khwâja 
Rule, Sufism, Shamanism
XV) Ecology, Economics, 
Geography, Pastoralism
XVI) Analyses of Social 
Policies, Politics, Strategic 
Issues and Current Events

I) Online Databases and 
Information Sources (all 
periods)
The following are the most 
comprehensive online sources 
for material on Xinjiang. My own 
bibliography is simply a list of 
the contents of the first 12 years of 
two important scholarly series in 
Xinjiang. The ODIA S and RIFIAS are likewise 
bibliographic sources. The Tôyô Bunko archive, 
IDP, ORIAS and Silk Road Seattle 
sites provide a wide range of important and 
high-quality materials directly online.

Bibliography of Uyghur language 
articles on history and literature by Nathan Light (lists contents of the 
series Shinjang Tarikh Materiyalliri 
(volumes 1-33, 1980-1992) and the 
journal Bulaq: Uyghur kilassik 
ädibiyati mâjmua’âsi (issues 1-41, 
1980-1992). Bulaq consists of editions and analyses of works of 
Eastern Turki (Uyghur) literature and 
translations of works from Persian 
and Turkic languages. Most of these 
entries have also been entered into 
the ODIA S database.) <http:// 
homepages.utoledo.edu/nlight/ 
uygarticles.htm>.

Digital Archive of Tôyô Bunko Rare 
Books (35 books, 9062 pages from 
art historical and research 
publications from the past 150 
years; high quality photos) <http:// 
ds.r.nai.ac.jp/toyobunko/>.

IDP: International Dunhuang Project 
Database (Search from collections of texts and artifacts from sites 
throughout Chinese Central Asia by 
Manuscript, Photograph, Artifact, 
Catalogue, Painting, and geo-
graphically by Map.) <http:// 
idp.bl.uk/ManuscriptSearch>.

ODIA S (Online Databases for Inner 
Asia Studies, with citations for 
articles, books and manuscripts) 
<http://www.gicas.jp/orias/ 
odias.htm>.

ORIAS Digitized books (Kashgar 
imprints from the Swedish Mission 
Press and Publications of China 
gicas.jp/orias/digibooks.htm>.

RIFIAS: Research Institute for Inner 
Asian Studies Online Library Catalog 
(A searchable library catalog of 
roughly 10,000 items available in the 
RIFIAS collection at Indiana 
University, Bloomington, along with 
a catalog of 400 RIFIAS pub-
lications.)<http://www.indiana.edu/ 
~rifias/Library_Catalog.htm>.

Silk Road Seattle (research resources maintained under direction of Daniel C. Waugh) <http://depts.washington.edu/ 
uwch/silkroad/>.

The Silk Road and Central Asia On 
the World Wide Web (books 
and articles maintained by Daniel C. Waugh) <http://depts.washington.edu/
reecas/outreach/silklink.htm>.

II) Selected Historical Back-
ground and Reference for 
Central Eurasia and Prior to 
1500 CE
These are the most important 
works for an overview under-
standing the region and for 
guiding further research.

Bartold, V. V. Turkestans Down to the 
Mongol Invasion. 3rd ed. H.A.R. Gibb 
and Tatiana Minorsky, trans. C.E. 
Biowski, ed. London, Luzac & co., 
1968. [Online at the ACLS history 
umich.edu/HEB00858.>]

Beckwith, Christopher. The Tibetan 
Empire in Central Asia: A history of 
the struggle for great power among 
Tibetans, Turks, Arabs, and Chinese 
during the Early Middle Ages. 
Princeton: Princeton University 

Bregel, Yuri. An Historical Atlas of 

Chavannes, Édouard. Documents sur 
Les Tou-Klue (Turcs) occidentaux, 
recueillis et commentés, suivis de 
notes additionnelles. Paris: Librarie 
d'Amerique et d'Orient, 1903.

Clark, Larry. "Introduction to the 
Uyghur Civil Documents of East 
Turkestân (13th-14th Centuries)." 
Indiana University, 1975.

Di Cosmo, Nicola, ed. Warfare in 
Inner Asian History: 500-1800. 

—. Ancient China and its Enemies: 
The Rise of Nomadic Power in East 
Asian History. New York: Cambridge 

Eberhard, Wolfram. China und seine 
westlichen Nachbarn: Beitrag zur 
mittelalterlichen und neueren 
Geschichte Zentralasiens. 
Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesell-

Elverskog, Johan. Uyghur Buddhist 

Golden, Peter. An Introduction to the 
History of the Turkic Peoples. 

Güzeld, Hasan Celal, et al, eds. The 
Turks. 6 vols. Ankara: Yeni Türkiye, 
2002. [Chronological collection of 
articles of varying scholarly depth 
and accuracy. First 3 volumes include 
articles on Central Asian Turkic 
populates.]

Hamilton, James Russell. Les 
Ouighours à l'époque des Cinq 
Dynasties d’après les documents 
History of Civilizations of Central Asia. Paris: Unesco, 1992-. 5 vols. [An extensive publishing project including over 100 articles on culture, history, religions, society and technology of the region. Some of this material is online at <http://www.unesco.org/culture/asia/html_eng/ouvrages.htm>.]

Han, Xiang. Qiuci shi ku. Ürümchi: Xinjiang Daxue chubanshe, 1990. [Extensive discussion of the Qiuci caves near Kucha, with many color plates.]


III) Collected Works

The collections below represent significant research compilations. A number of volumes of articles in Russian and many in Chinese are also valuable but less accessible. The Starr and CEMOTI volumes are both primarily oriented towards analysis of international relations, development, politics and statistics rather than ethnographic study. The Benson and Svanberg volume is somewhat more concerned with cultural analysis.


Ingvar Svanberg. "The Nomadism of Orta •üz Kazaks in Xinjiang, 1911-1949."


Mark Kirchner. "The Language of the Kazaks from Xinjiang: A Text Sample."

Thomas Hoppe. "Kazak Pastoralism in the Bogda Range."


Dru C. Gladney. "Internal Colonialism and the Uyghur Nationality: Chinese Nationalism and Its Subaltern Subjects."


Artoush Kumul. "Témoignage - Le "séparation" ouïgour au
Serial publications

The following are the more important serials and periodicals devoted to the history and culture of Xinjiang published in China and suggest the immense range of new publishing that began in the 1980s. I have not listed most popularly-oriented publications, nor those that primarily express Chinese government or local and émigré dissident political perspectives.

Bulaq; Uyghur kilissik adibiyati mäjmu’äsi. [Bulaq: Journal of Uyghur classical literature.] Ürümchi, 1980-. [Has published around 20,000 pages of articles and literary editions since inception.]

Miras; päsïllik zhurnal. [Heritage; quarterly journal. Published by the Junggo khälq eghiz ädibiyat-sän’ät tätqiqat ishkhanisi.] Ürümchi, 1983-. [Popularly-oriented journal about Uyghur literature, folklore, and folk art.]

Shinjiang Dashösi ilmiy zhurnal. Päsäpä-ijtima‘i pän qismi. [Journal of the Xinjiang Academy of Sciences.] Ürümchi, 1980-. At least 4 volumes of dastan prose and poetry narratives.]

Shinjiang Dashösi ilmiy zhurnal. Uyghur tätqiqat jämiyiti Shinjiang Uyghur aptonom rayonluq şöbisi; Uyghur tätqiqat ishkhanisi. [Xinjiang University Scientific Journal. Philosophy and Social Science Section.] Ürümchi, 1980-. [At least 6 volumes of folk songs with musical transcriptions.]

Uyghur khälq qoshqalrï. [Folk quatrains with musical transcriptions.]

Xibe minzu yanjiu = Research in N.W. national minorities. [Academic journal published in Lanzhou.]

Xiyu yanjiu = The Western Regions Studies. Ürümchi, 1991-. [Another recently established journal.]

Bibliographies and Manuscript Descriptions

The most important primary sources for study of the past 500 years are Persian, Turkic, Manchu and Chinese manuscript and archival documents. The extensive Chinese sources have appeared in a number of facsimile editions and I list only a few of the research guides to them here. The other sources are only beginning to be systematically studied and published and...
access remains a problem. Although most have some deficiencies, the sources below are the best descriptions of the available primary and secondary source materials.


Chen Yanqi and Sasha. Xiyu yanjiu shumu. Ürümchi: Xinjiang renmin chubanshe, 1990. [Classified bibliography of 6734 Chinese, European, Russian and Japanese books on Central Asia and Xinjiang (known in Chinese as Xiyu or the Western Regions.).]


Hofman, H. F. Turkish literature. A bio-bibliographical survey. Section III. Moslim Central Asian Turkish literature. 6 volumes bound as 2. Utrecht: Royal Asiatic Society of Great Britain and Ireland, 1969. [Erudite, chatty and often obscure annotations on the authors and works of Central Asian Turkic manuscript literature.]

Hoppe, Thomas. Xinjiang-Arbeitsbibliographie II: Autonomes Gebiet Xinjiang der Uiguren, China (Naturbedingungen, Geschichte, Ethnien, Landnutzung); Xinjiang provisional bibliography II: Xinjiang Uigur Autonomous Region, China (natural conditions, history, ethnic groups, land use). Wiesbaden: O. Harrassowitz, 1987. [Roughly 2000 items primarily in English, German, Russian, Chinese and Uyghur.]


Liu Ge and Huang Xianyang. Xiyu shidi lunwen caliliao suoyin. Ürümchi: Xinjiang renmin chubanshe, 1988. [Classified bibliography of 8032 articles in Chinese about history, minorities, economy, culture, literature, language, geography and archeology of the "Western Regions."]

Matsuura, S. "A bibliography of works on the Manchu and Sibo languages." Memoirs of the Research Department of the Tôyô Bunko 38 (1980), p. 95-179. [Sibo or Xibe is the only form of Manchu that continues to be spoken and written in China.]

Muginov, Abdullahzhan Muginovich. Opisanie uigurskih rukopisei Instituta Narodov Azii. [Description of Uyghur Manuscripts in the Institute of the Peoples of Asia.] Moscow: 1962. [Classifies a group of traditional manuscripts as "Uyghur" based on linguistic features, and time and place of composition, while ignoring other popular Turkic and Persian works found in Eastern Turkistan.]

Sawut, Torsunmuhhämät. Uyghur adäbiyati tarikhi materiyalılar katalogi. Ürümchi: Shinjiang Dashö Därslık Bölümü, 1991. [A typescript volume listing 3541 books and articles about Uyghur literary history, organized by period and subject, and 665 manuscript titles held in eight collections in Ürümchi.]


VI) Historical and Hagio-graphical Primary Sources

The following are the few editions and translations that have made local primary source documents and compositions available. These editions are of widely varying quality. I again avoid most of the Chinese local histories and gazetteers although these have been heavily used by Enoki, Fletcher, Hamada, Kim, Millward, and Saguchi. Kim's endnotes are a comprehensive discussion on the different sources for 19th century history.


translation and epitome of a key hagiographic source for Eastern Turkistan. For details about the work and problems with this translation, see DeWeese, “The Tadhkira-i Bughra-khan...”]

Chingiznamâ. Haji Nurhaji, ed. Kashgar: Qâshqâr Uyghur Nâshriyât, 1985. [Edited from a manuscript now held at the Xinjiang Academy of Social Sciences, #00679. Matches the anonymous Târîkh-i Kâshgar (see below) but here ascribed to Molla Mersalih Kashqâri.]


Gürsoy-Naskali, Emine, transl. and ed. Ashâbu’i-Khaft; A treatise in Eastern Turki. Helsinki: Suomalais-ugrilainen seura, 1985. [Valuable study of a tomb and pilgrimage site near Turfan where the story of the Seven Sleepers of Ephesus has become locally attached. Qurbân’ali Khâlidî describes traveling to this site in his Târîkh-i jarâda-yi jadîda.]


—. Le pays de Hami ou Khamil; description, histoire d’apres les auteurs chinois, Paris, E. Leroux, 1892.


—. Tarih-i jarâda-yi jadîda. Qazan, 1889. [Author lived in the Tarbaghatay town known as Chôchâk, Chuguchak or Tacheng and has important connections to Eastern Turkistan and its Islamic history.]


Sayrami, Mulla Musa. Tarihî âminîyâ. Muhammât Zunun, ed. Ürümchi: Shînjang Khâlq Nâshriyât, 1991. [Early twentieth-century historian whose manuscript work was first published as a lithograph by Pantusov in 1905 in Tashkent.]

—. Tarihî Hâmidi. Ánvår Baytur, ed. Beijing: Millâtîr Nâshriyât, 1986. [Edited from a 1911 autograph manuscript of this work which extends and elaborates Sayrami’s Tarihî ãminîyâ. Lund collection of Gunnar Jarring contains another copy.]


VII) Studies of History

The more important historical studies, using Chinese, Turkic, and Persian sources as well as the archival documents of the British, Ottoman, Russian and Qing Empires. Some Soviet-era studies exhibit anti-Chinese biases, although B.A. Akhmedov and Iu. G. Baranova are free of these. The works of Benson, Forbes, Kim, Saguchi, and Wang are generally excellent, although Baranova already put forth Kim’s argument about Ya’qûb Beg’s international balancing act. The works of Bughra, Kurban, Saray, Turfani, Aitchen Wu and Sheng Shi-htsi (with Whiting) exhibit the biases of political participants and their allies.

Akhmedov, B.A. ed. Iz istorii Srednei Azii i Vostochnogo Turkestana XV-XIX...


Everest-Phillips, Max. "The Suburban King Of Tartary." Asian Affairs, 21/3 (1990): 324-335. [Claiming he represented the Muslim community of Chinese Turkistan as king, Dr. Bertram William Sheldrake traveled widely and gave lectures as a new monarch. Press attention faded quickly.]


Galiev, V. V. Kazakhstan v sisteme rossiisko-kitaiskikh ekonomicheskih otnoshenii v Sin'tsziane (konets XIX-nachalo XX vv.). [Kazakhstan in the System of Russo-Chinese Commercial and Economic Relations in Xinjiang (End of the 19th-Beginning of the 20th Centuries.)] Almaty: Institut istorii i etnologii im. Ch. Ch. Valiakhanova, 2003. [Valuable study based extensively on Russian consular reports and some Russian archival material.]


—. Jihad, hijra et ‘devoir du sel’ dans l’histoire du Turkestan oriental. Turcica [Belgium], 33 (2001): 35-61. [Sharia and the concept of jihad played a continuing role under Muslim elites, but the imperial salt tax was seen as a legitimate duty to the Manchu emperors. Originally published as “Shio no gimu’ to ‘Seisen’ tono aida de.” Tōyōshi Kenkyū 52(2): 122-148.]


Höri, Sunao. "Shincho no Kaikyo tochi no nisan no mondai: Yarukando no ichishiryō no kento o tsujite" [Some problems on the Ch'ing rule over Hui-Chiang...]. Shigaku Zasshi, 88/3 (1979): 1-36. [A study of a tax ledger suggesting that native officials were not cooperating with the conquerors in compiling figures for the poll tax.]

—. "Uiguru no rekishi to bungaku no kenkyu jokyo-Urumchi de no


Lias, Godfrey. Kazak Exodus. London: Evans Brothers, 1956. [Using reports of Qazaq refugees in Turkey, Lias describes the events leading up to their departure from China.]


Lin, Enxian. Qingchao zai Xinjiang de Han Hui geli zhengce. [The Qing Dynasty policies for segregating Han and Muslims in Xinjiang.] Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan, 1988.


are the political interactions of Mongol states with their neighbors. Among these the Monghuls and Oyirad/Junghar/Kalmuk Mongols were among the last to maintain Chingizid principles of legitimation. Another important and heavily studied international dimension involves Ya'qûb Beg's struggles to maintain power through alliances with the Qing, Russian, British and even Ottoman empires. The scholars making the best use of available archives and materials include Di Cosmo, Fletcher, Millward, Miyawaki, Moiseev, Pelliot, Perdue, and Zlatkin.


I. A source of the Erdeni-yin erike.

II. China and Central Asia, 1368-1884.

III. An Oyirod letter in the British Museum.

IV. Central Asian Sufism and Ma Ming-hs'in's New Teaching.

V. Confrontations between Muslim missionaries and nomad unbelievers in the late sixteenth century: notes on four passages from the 'Diya' al-qulub'.

VI. The Naqshbandiyya and the dhikr-i arra.

VII. Turco-Mongolian monarchic tradition in the Ottoman Empire.

VIII. The biography of Khwush Kipak Beg (d. 1781) in the Wai-fan Meng-kuw bang piao chuan.

IX. The Mongols: ecological and social perspectives.

X. Integrative history: parallels and interconnections in the early modern period, 1500-1800.

XI. The Naqshbandiyya in northwest China.


Hsü, Immanuel C. Y. The Ili Crisis: A Study of Sino-Russian Diplomacy,


Zotov, O. Kitai i Vostochnyi Turkestan v XV-XVIII vekakh; mezhdosu-
IX) Western Explorers, Missionaries, and Consuls (excluding travel accounts not related to formal expeditions)

The works listed below are the more important accounts of ethnographic and archaeological expeditions in Eastern Turkestan since the mid-1800s. Most of these expeditions also result in extensive publications about archaeological and manuscript materials. I have left out many publications by Japanese and Russian explorers because these are readily found through the secondary sources listed here. There are also at least 400 travel narratives in Western languages and many more in Chinese and Japanese. Daniel Waugh and Adela Lee's compilation of bibliographies on early travelers and many more in Chinese and Japanese. Daniel Waugh and Adela Lee's compilation of bibliographies on early travelers and many more in Chinese and Japanese. Daniel Waugh and Adela Lee's compilation of bibliographies on early travelers and many more in Chinese and Japanese.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Editions</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grenard, Fernand.</td>
<td><em>J.-L. Dutreuil de Rhins; Mission scientifique dans la haute Asie, 1890-1895.</em> 2 vols. Paris: E. Leroux, 1897-1898. [This important description of exploration, history, folklore and religious traditions was completed by Grenard after the death of Dutreuil de Rhins.]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>—.</td>
<td><em>The Wandering Lake</em>. F. H. Lyon, trans. New York: E. P. Dutton, 1940. [Hedin’s discovery of why the location of Lake Lop-Nor changed over the centuries.]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[For an introduction to Hedin’s voluminous bibliography, see Daniel C. Waugh’s “A Sven Hedin Bibliography” <a href="http://www.silkroadfoundation.org/bibliography/hedimb3.html">http://www.silkroadfoundation.org/bibliography/hedimb3.html</a>.]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Le Coq, Albert von.</td>
<td><em>Buried treasures of Chinese Turkestan: an account of the activities and adventures of the...</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Skirin, C. P. Chinese Central Asia. London,: Methuen, 1926. [Still valuable descriptive account based on his travels in Western Xinjiang while British Consul in Kashgar, 1922-1924.]


X) Basic Sources for Linguistics and Language Study

Turkic, Manchu, and Mongol languages are vast fields and many works have been published on these and other historical and modern languages of Eastern Turkistan. The list below primarily references works useful for studying modern Uyghur since it is the dominant language of the region and has only a limited number of speakers elsewhere. The most comprehensive bilingual dictionaries are those produced by Nadzhip, Iliev and Schwarz, while the multivolume dictionary produced by Abilz Yaqub, et al, provides examples of usage. Schwarz and Jarring both include information about etymology and Schwarz provides classified word lists and illustrations. A comprehensive dialect dictionary has yet to be produced, but Ghopuri, Jarring, Malov, Osmanov, Sadvqasov, and Tenishev have gathered important materials. Many of the collections of oral texts listed below consist are folklore materials.


Qawuz, Qadir. Han-Ying-Wei chengyu cidian= A Chinese-English-
XI) Studies of Literature and Literary History

The study of medieval Turkic literary history and Turkic linguistics are fairly advanced but authors from the last 500 years have attracted less international interest and are assigned to one or another national literature. This results in tendentious literary histories that attempt to strengthen or at least adjudicate the validity of, for example, Uyghur or Uzbek claims to particular authors. Only a few studies such as those of Arshidinov and Friederich have begun to move beyond the cataloging, categorizing and historicizing modes of literary analysis to understand literature in its social contexts, and local scholars have also been reluctant to accept religious materials such as hagiographies within the nationalized literary traditions. The simple model of an evolving "national" literature has over-specialized the study of medieval literature, and has given rise to an author-driven approach that is both unrepresentative and anachronistic. This results in a tendency to limit the study of medieval literature to the "national" literature of the central states, while excluding popular poetry such as Mashrab and the Uzbeks.


Ghochur, Vahtijan and Ashgar Husain. Uyghur klassik adibiyati tezisli. Beijing, 1987. [A wide-ranging history of the authors and works that are now considered part of the Uyghur literary tradition, from the Uyghur Qaghanate through the Idigut kingdom and the Qarakhans, including Abu Nasir Muhammad Farabi and many Chaghatay authors, but excluding popular poets such as Mashrab and Huwaydâ who have been assigned to the Uzbeks.]


XII) Performing Arts, Ethnomusicology, Folklore, Folk Art, Architecture and Material Culture

The study of Turkic, Mongol and Manchu folk traditions in Eastern Turkistan has a long history, and oral literature and music in particular have remained productive topics for research and publishing while religion has been more sensitive in China and the Soviet Union. Folk qoshaq and dastan songs have been published and analyzed in Russian and Uyghur, but there has been little comparative investigation of the widely circulated materials such as the romantic dastans and Nasirdin Apandi (Hoca Nasreddin) tales. M. Alieva has written on the characteristics of oral folklore genres: nakhsha, bayt and qoshaq (songs), lapaq (humorous song and dance performances), tepishmaq (riddles), maqal-tamsl (proverbs, sayings), chochak (tales), rivayat (legend), apsan (myth), latip (humorous anecdotes), but despite the excellent work of Radlov, Pantusov, Katanov, Malov (see under linguistics), Jarring, Le Coq, and Reichl there has been little comparative or ethnographic work on narrative and song forms. In addition to items listed here many others Uyghur song and tale collections have been published in Xinjiang and Kazakhstan, making the available material very rich.

International interest over the past 20 years has focused on the Uyghur muqam song tradition because of its importance as a symbol of Uyghur cultural identity and history and its relationship to maqamat traditions in other parts of Eurasia, with the work of Light, Nathan. “Kazakhs of the Tarbaghatai: Ethno-History Through a Novel.” The Turkish Studies Association Bulletin, 17/2 (1993): 91-102. [Analysis of a novel about nomadic life from an ethnographic perspective.]


Narynaev, Aziz I. Progressivnaya obschestvenno-filosofskaya mysli' Uigurov vtoroi poloviny XIX v. Frunze: Ilim, 1988. [Social philosophies of late 19th-century Uyghur authors in order to reclaim ancestors as progressive thinkers.]


Sherip, Islamjan and Abdukerim Rakhman, eds. Uyghur pailsap tarikhigha ait masiliilar. Kashgar: Qashqar Uyghur Nasiriyati, 1981. [Articles about the philosophical tradition expressed by Uyghur authors.]


Jarring, Gunnar. "A Sibe-Manchu Version of "Volshebnogo mertvetsa."[1 Text from Khotan and Yarkand. 2. Texts from Kashghar, Tashmalig und Kucha. 3. Folk-lore from Guma. 4. Ethnological and historical texts from Guma.]


Mamay, Jüüsüp. *Manas; Qirghiz elinin tarikhiy eposu*. Ürumchi: Shinjang Khâlq Nâshriyati, 1992. [Extensive version of the Manas epic planned to include at least 8 volumes.]


Pantusov, N. N. *Materalny k izucheniiu nariechiia Taranchei Ilîskago okruga*. [Materials for the Study of the Taranchi Dialect of the


—. Uyghur folklori hajqida bayan. Ürümchi: Xinjiang University Press, 1990. [Describes traditional daily life, rituals, farming, trade, food, healing, and material culture.]


Tömür, Kewir. Molla Zäydin hajqida qissâ. 2 vols. Ürümchi: Xinjiang Khatlq Narsiyati, 1981-91. [Stories about a famous trickster figure who lived in the Turfan region during the 19th century.]


Wei, Cuiyi and Karl W. Luckert. Uyghur stories from along the Silk Road. Lanham, Md.: University Press of America, 1998. [A collection of literary and oral stories arranged and annotated according to a theory of survivals and cultural evolution: each story is supposed to reflect a particular stage of socio-economic development.]


XIII) Anthropology, Cultural Analysis, Ethnography, Ethnicity, Ethnogenesis

Ethnic identity and ethnogenesis in Xinjiang have been a central focus of study for many scholars. Cesaro, Clark, Gladney, Hoppe, Roberts, Rudelson, Smith, and Svanberg offer nuanced insights into the complexities of ethnicity, but Gladney’s point that ethnic distinctions are not very important when Uyghurs move to Turkey should be extended to the situation in Xinjiang as well: ethnic identity is only contingently salient and much is missed by an exclusive focus on it. As with many of the literary studies above, ethnographers tend towards too much attention to ethnic differences. Ethnic identities are important modes of negotiating political and social organization and activities both on the interpersonal and on the level of state bureaucracy and public performances, but they offer only a partial perspective on social life. Life in Xinjiang involves more than deciphering the changing ways politics, culture, history, and rights are linked to ethnicity. Practices more strongly associated with gender, class, and religion—although these are also changing—are equally important, and here the works of Bellér-Hann and Hann are particularly valuable. Historical accounts of cultural practices can be found in the works on Chvyr,
Iskhakov, Le Coq, Pelliot and Pevtsov.


—. “Making the oil fragrant.’ Deals with the supernatural among the Uighur in Xinjiang.” Asian Ethnicity, 2/1 (2001): 9-23.


Hann, Chris M. "Ethnic games in Xinjiang: anthropological approach-


XIV) Religion: Islam, khwâja Rule, Sufism, Shamanism

Religious practices and the history and politics of religion in the region now called Xinjiang offer many aspects and sources for study. Studies of religious practices were limited by PRC government policies until recently, but many earlier officials, ethnographers and explorers made detailed reports about religion. Most of the historical and ethnographic items included above mention religion, and the Islamic primary sources are particularly important for these topics as Islam became increasingly important in the social and political lives of Turkic speakers over the past 500 years. In addition to items listed below, the works of Bellér-Hann on healing practices, the historical studies by Fletcher and Hartmann, and the collections of folklore by Katanov, Pantusov, and Radlov are particularly rich sources for religious ideas and practices.


Penkala-Gawecka, Danuta. [Chosen by spirits or how to become a shaman: the example of a Uighur shaman woman from Kazakhstan.] *Lud; organ Polskiego Towarzystwa Ludoznawczego*, 85 (2001): 153-91. [In Polish with English summary. This reference from RLG’s Eureka Anthrology Plus did not give original title.]


Shinmen, Yasushi. “Shinkyo musulimu hanran (1931-34) to himitsu soshiki” [The Xinjiang Muslim rebellion (1931-34) and secret societies]. *Shigaku Zasshi*, 99/12 (1990): 1-42.


Isenbike Togan. “Differences in Ideology and Practice: the Case of the Black and White Mountains Faction.”

Sawada Minoru. “Fieldworks at Muslim Mausoleum in the Tarim Basin.”

Hamada Masami. “Le Mausolée de Satuq Bughra Khan à Artush.”


Thierry Zarcone. “Le Culte des saints au Xinjiang (de 1911 à nos jours).”

N. Pantusov. “Le Mazâr de Maviânhâ Yusuf Sakaki (ou Shakaki).”

N. Pantusov. “Les Mausolées musulmans de la ville de Uch-Turfan et de ses environs en territoire chinois.”

 XV) Ecology, Economics, Geography, Pastoralism

Economics and geography have been topics of interest to imperial powers involved Eastern Turkistan since the Manchu conquest in 1758, or even before if Miyawaki Junko is correct in seeing Junghar history as driven in part by a quest for economic control over the Tarim agricultural regions. The study of the cultural and ecological bases of pastoral nomadism has long fascinated scholars of Eurasia, and motivated analysis of the ecological basis of political and military expansion, as in Owen Lattimore’s Inner Asian Frontiers of China (N.Y., 1940). Many of the historical works listed above follow up these issues in more detail, as well as the studies on Qazasq [Kazakhs] by Benson, Svanberg, Hoppe and Light.

Eastern Turkistan’s trade ties with nearby regions and its participation in “Silk Road” trade more generally have been another focus of scholarly attention. Millward’s article on the silk-horse trade and Beyond the Pass (listed in “world history” above) and Saguchi’s article on Kokand trade provide excellent introductions. Fletcher’s article in Cambridge History of China also discusses trade ties. The expedition reports and articles by Roberts, Toops and Wiemer in the volume edited by Starr listed above are also important discussions of trade and economics.


XVI | Analyses of Social Policies, Politics, Strategic Issues and Current Events

Recent political analyses have moved somewhat beyond the collation and analysis of press reports that was the dominant mode for the study of Communist China from the 1950s through the 1980s. Now that fieldwork and archival research are more feasible, more sophisticated studies are being published, although analysis of news and propaganda reports continues. Becquelin, Bovingdon, Dwyer and Millward offer the best insights into present conditions. Most of the articles in the 1998 CEMOTI issue and in Xinjiang: China's Muslim Borderland (Starr, ed.) are also relevant here. Dillon's volume is a useful but uncritical analysis of Chinese studies on Islamic political movements.


—. "Xinjiang In The Nineties." China Journal [Australia], 44 (2000): 65-91. [Discusses causes of local political protests.]

—. "Staged development in Xinjiang." China Quarterly, 178 (June 2004): 358-378. [Analyzes the changes in government efforts to integrate Xinjiang into the heartland, and the strategies for placating ethno-nationalism.]


Bactrian Camels and Bactrian-Dromedary Hybrids

Daniel Potts
University of Sydney

If the Silk Road may be described as "the bridge between Eastern and Western cultures," then the Bactrian camel should rightfully be considered the principal means of locomotion across that bridge. Yet there is a great deal of misinformation concerning the Bactrian camel and its relatives, particularly in the ancient Near Eastern literature. This paper explores some of the problems surrounding Camelus bactrianus and the little-known hybrids of the Bactrian with the Arabian dromedary (Camelus dromedarius).

Zoologists nowadays tend to favor the idea that Camelus bactrianus and dromedarius are descendants of two different subspecies of Camelus ferus (Peters and von den Driesch 1997: 652), and modern research suggests that the original habitat of the wild, two-humped camel extended from the great bend of the Yellow River in northwestern China through Mongolia to central Kazakhstan (Schaller 1998: 154; Nowak 1999: 1078; Bannikov 1976: 399) generally at elevations of 1500-2000 m. above sea-level. Although some scholars have suggested the original habitat of C. ferus may have extended as far west as the Caspian Sea, this is unlikely. If this were true, we should expect to find C. ferus faunal remains at prehistoric and early historic sites around the Caspian, but this is not the case. Moreover, to suggest that the natural distribution areas of the wild two-humped camel extended so far to the west flies in the face of everything that is known about the physiology and environmental adaptations of C. bactrianus (see below).

The survival of C. ferus in Inner Asia was long suspected but no firm evidence was available until N.M. Przewalski killed and described several specimens in 1873 (Camelus ferus Przewalski 1878 [?]). C. ferus has been described as "relatively small, lithe, and slender-legged, with very narrow feet and a body that looks laterally compressed" (Schaller 1998: 152). C. ferus has "low, pointed, cone-shaped humps - usually about half the size of those of the domestic camel in fair condition" (Bannikov 1976: 398). Representations of camels in the rock art of Palaeolithic caves in eastern Mongolia, such as Chojt-Zenker Cave, show what are believed to be C. ferus (Peters and von den Driesch 1997: 653, 661). (Fig. 1) C. ferus were still hunted in the medieval era in the Khotan, Turfan, Tarim, Lob and Katak regions of Inner Asia, and in Mongolia (Roux 1959-60: 50-51), while 18th-century Chinese...
records attest to the presence of wild camels on the northern and western edges of the Chinese empire (Lehmann 1891: 99). Small numbers are present in the region to this day (Heptner, Nasimovic and Bannikov 1966: 85-94; Bannikov 1976; Schaller 1998: 151-162).

The wild range of C. ferus, in all likelihood, extended only as far west as central Kazakhstan. This is significant for a number of reasons but first and foremost because this means that the natural distribution of the wild, two-humped progenitor of what we know as the domesticated Bactrian camel would not have included Bactria (northern Afghanistan/southern Turkmenistan) at all. How, then, to explain the name “Bactrian” given to the domesticated two-humped camel?

The term “Bactrian” was first applied to two-humped camels by Aristotle, who wrote of “the two species of camel, Bactrian and Arabian” (Historia Animalium 2.1 [498b9]) and noted that “The Bactrian camel differs from the Arabian in having two humps as against the latter’s one” (Historia Animalium 2.1 [499a15-17]). Some scholars have suggested that the name “Bactrian” became associated with the two-humped camel because camel-breeding developed in Bactria after initial domestication in eastern Iran and/or southern Turkmenistan (Schuegraf and Terbuyken 2001: 1225), but, as indicated above, this is not supported by the faunal evidence and it seems more likely that the Bactrian camel was introduced into Bactria proper from further east, not the south (eastern Iran/Seistan) or the west (Turkmenistan). Thus, like many commodities one can think of — Brussels sprouts or India ink — C. bactrianus would seem to be a misnomer. We have no idea where Aristotle got the designation “Bactrian” for the domesticated, two-humped camel, but he seems to have been responsible for introducing a term into the literature which should never have been applied to a mammal that was almost certainly domesticated outside of the region with which it is popularly associated.

Pure-bred Bactrians stand 1.5-2.4 m high to the top of the humps and are normally 1.68-1.63 m long, with a mean weight of 460 kgs (Epstein 1969: 118). They have been known to carry loads of 220-270 kgs some 30-40 kms daily, or 80-100 kms if pulling a loaded cart (Walz 1954: 56). Bactrian camels, which can live to be 35-40 years old, are generally put to work at the age of four and can expect to have 20-25 years of productive work (Epstein 1969: 120). They are at their best in the dry cold of the winter and spring months in Inner Asia, when their thick coats provided them with ample warmth. Able to withstand extremes of heat and cold, Bactrians prefer temperatures below 21° C but are capable of tolerating a 70°-broad range between winter lows and summer highs (Manefield and Tinson 2000: 38). Consistent heat, however, is intolerable for Bactrians and the caravans which once set out from China westwards across the Gobi desert always travelled in winter (Walz 1954: 55-56). Bactrians have been known to function at altitudes of up to 4000 m. above sea level, e.g. in the Pamirs (Gauthier-Pilters and Dagg 1981: 6). After a long journey they were typically rested for 1-2 weeks and were pastured for the summer months on the steppe, where they built up their fat reserves again in anticipation of further caravan crossings the following winter (Walz 1954: 56).

The precise chronology of the gradual westward spread of the Bactrian camel is difficult to determine, but the available evidence nonetheless suggests we are dealing with a “sloping chronology,” i.e. a progression from earlier finds in the east towards later finds in the west. The principal difficulty that arises in verifying this hypothesis is the relative paucity of well-studied and dated faunal assemblages from sites within the range of C. ferus. Camelid faunal remains are said to have been found (Olsen 1988: 21)3 at Neolithic sites near Baotou (Inner Mongolia) and Lake Barkhol (northeast Xinjiang), and although it is not certain that these are C. bactrianus as opposed to C. ferus, they were certainly two-humped. The likelihood that these were domestic Bactrians is considered strong given that the locales would have been difficult to reach without the use of the camel (Peters and von den Driesch 1997: 661). As Lehmann wrote in 1891 (p. 141; my translation): “Without the camel neither the icy steppes of Western Siberia nor the inner Asian plains were inhabitable; they would have remained until today an insurmountable obstacle to communication and would have made a nomadic existence impossible.”

By the middle of the fourth millennium BCE C. bactrianus was probably present in southern Turkmenistan. This being the case, and assuming a more or less continuous distribution of C. bactrianus from central Kazakhstan to the west, the animal was probably already present in Bactria by this time as well.6 Other sites on the southern (Iranian) side of the Kopet Dağh, however, do not show evidence of C. bactrianus at this early date.7 More Turkmenian evidence of C. bactrianus dates to the first half of the third millennium BCE. This includes terracotta models of wheeled carts drawn by Bactrian camels found at Altyne-depe in contexts dating to the Namazga IV period (Kohl 1992: 186) as well as faunal remains from Shor-depe,
Chong-depe and Hayaz-depe (Compagnoni and Tosi 1978: Table 3). By the late third and early second millennium BCE the Bactrian camel is attested in the iconography of copper stamp seals and figurines thought to be from Bactria.9

Looking much further west, an unprovenanced cylinder seal in Old Syrian style in the Walters Art Gallery on which a Bactrian camel is depicted has been dated stylistically to c. 1750-1700 BCE (Gordon 1939: Pl. 7.55; Collon 2000: Fig. 8), but whether the fact that it bears a rider should be read as an indication that Bactrians were being ridden (e.g. Pohl 1950: 252) is unclear. Gordon noted that the awkwardness of the camel’s form on the Walters seal indicated that the seal-cutter was unfamiliar with Bactrian camels. We cannot say whether this seal reflects the presence of Bactrian camels in the Syro-Anatolian area in the early second millennium BCE, direct contacts between Syro-Anatolia and a region in which Bactrians were present (whether native or introduced), and/or indirect contacts between such regions via intermediaries like Elam or Assyria.

A possible indication of the northwestward spread of the Bactrian camel by or during the third millennium BCE may be provided by faunal remains in today’s Tatarstan and Ukraine,10 and there is evidence of the southward and eastward spread of C. bactrianus into Pakistani Baluchistan beginning in the early second millennium BCE.11 As we move ahead into the Iron Age, there is little persuasive evidence to demonstrate the presence of Bactrian camels in western Iran.12

This brings us, chronologically speaking, to the Achaemenid period when the Bactrian delegation, illustrated on the Apadana reliefs at Persepolis (Fig. 2, p. 58, below), is shown bringing Bactrian camels to the imperial capital, and a Bactrian camel appears on one of the small gold plaques from the Oxus Treasure (Curtis and Searight 2003: Fig. 6.50). Thereafter, depictions of Bactrian camels become increasingly common, e.g. the Sarmatian gold plaques at Filippovka near the Ural River on the Eurasian steppes north of the Caspian (Aruz et al. 2000: Figs. 68, 96, 98) of fifth/fourth century BCE date. A particularly clear depiction from the late fifth century BCE occurs on a red-figured squat lekythos (E 695) in the British Museum (Curtius 1928: Abb. 6). Some scholars suggest that the Greeks first came into contact with Bactrian camels in Asia Minor, to which region they had been brought as a result of Achaemenid expansion (Schauenburg 1962: 99). Indeed Herodotus says that camels carried provisions for the advancing Persians, marvelling that Xerxes’ camel train was attacked by lions while marching between Acanthus and Therma, even though the lions “had never seen that beast before, nor had any experience of it” (7.125). We do not know whether these were dromedaries, like those used by Cyrus against Croesus of Lydia (Herodotus 1.80).13

According to Soviet research (cited in Peters and von den Driesch 1997: 662), Bactrian camels were present and probably eaten during the Hellenistic period in Choresmia, between the Aral Sea and the Amu Darya (Oxus) River. Finally, T’ang period (seventh/eighth century) tomb figures of Bactrian camels from China, some of which stand more than half a meter tall, are shown heavily laden with cargo (Volmer, Keall and Nagai-Berthrong 1983: 47, 66) confirming their use as pack animals at this time.

In summary, the evidence just reviewed attests to an ever-expanding zone in which C. bactrianus is attested archaeologically outside the presumed native habitat of C. ferus. Although the data are not as plentiful as one would like, there is a general sense in which we move from the earliest evidence in the east (Neolithic Inner Mongolia) towards the west, with evidence beginning to appear in Turkmenistan (mid-fourth millennium BCE), Margiana and Bactria (mid-third millennium BCE) and surrounding areas to the north (Andronovo, Tripolye contexts) and south (Pirak, in Pakistani Baluchistan) as we move into the later second and early first millennium BCE. Above all, the available evidence flatly contradicts the idea that the two-humped camel was first domesticated in Bactria, and then spread eastward to China. In fact, it was precisely the opposite.

It is against the background of the archaeological evidence just reviewed that we turn now to some important epigraphic evidence attesting to the presence of C. bactrianus in Assyria from the end of the second through the middle of the first millennium BCE.

In a badly preserved fragment of the annals of Assur-bel-kala (1074-1057 BCE) on a tablet from Assur, the Assyrian king says that he sent merchants to acquire female Bactrian camels, udrate (Heimpel 1980: 331). On the Kurkh stele, Shalmaneser III (858-824 BCE) says that he brought back seven Bactrian camels as part of the booty from a campaign against Gilzanzu (Mitchell 2000: 188, n. 7 with refs.), now thought to have been in the area south of Lake Urmia in northwestern Iran (Zadok 2002: 142-143). These are indeed illustrated twice, on the Black Obelisk, excavated by Layard at Nimrud, where they occur in Band 1 (Bulliet 1975: Fig. 70), and on the bronze gate decoration (Band 7) from
Balawat, ancient Imgur-Enlil, several kilometers northeast of Nimrud (Bulliet 1975: Fig. 71). Interestingly, Bactrian camels are also shown in Band 3 on the Black Obelisk as tribute from Musri (Egypt).

Roughly a century later the Iranian stele of Tiglath-Pileser III (744-727 BCE), the exact provenance of which is unfortunately unknown, itemizes a long list of rulers from whom tribute was exacted, including several in the Zagros region of northwestern Iran. There we read, "And as for Iranzu of Mannae, Delta of Ellipi, the city rulers of Namri, of Singibutu (and) of all the eastern mountains - horses, mules, Bactrian camels, cattle (and) sheep I imposed upon them (as tribute) to be received annually in Assyria” (Tadmor 1994: 109). (15) In his first Babylonian campaign, the army of Sennacherib (704-681 BCE) seized both Bactrian and dromedary camels in Merodach-Baladân’s abandoned camp near Kish (Luckenbill 1924: 56, l. 7). Esarhaddon (680-669 BCE) campaigned against Patusherria to the east of Assyria, seizing Bactrian camels as booty.16

A debt-note from the reign of Esarhaddon, dating to 674 BC (Postgate 1976: 149, no. 38), shows us an Assyrian official named Dannaya putting two Bactrian camels at the disposal of three individuals. The text reads (Kwasman and Parpola 1991: no. 241):

Two double-humped camels belonging to Dannaya, at the disposal of Yahutu, Ilu-kenu-[usu], and Adad-aplu-[ddina]. They shall give the camels back on the first of [Marchesvan] (VIII). If they do not give them, they shall pay 6 minas of silver. Month Tishri (VII), 14th day, eponym year of Sarru-nuri. Witness Sigi-Issar. Witness Sulmu-sarri. Witness Adad-dan. [If] they do not pay the silver, it will increase by 2 shekels per mina.

These sources raise a number of questions. First, what of the lands from which Bactrian camels were acquired? With the possible exception of Patusherria, which may have been located as far east as the Pamirs (thus Vallat 1993), all of the regions mentioned as sources of Bactrian camels were situated in western Iran, from modern day Iranian Azerbaijan southwards to western Turistan. Yet as our review of the available faunal and other archaeological evidence of C. bactrianus has shown, nothing suggests that these areas were even remotely close to the most westerly regions where Bactrian camels are known in iconography and the faunal record. Indeed, judging by the faunal inventory at sites on the Iranian Plateau, Turkmenistan seems to be the most westerly of those areas where Bactrian camel use could be said to have become common. On the contrary, the presence of C. dromedarius remains at Chalcolithic Tepe Ghabristan (period 4, c. 3700-3000 BCE) and early Iron Age Tepe Sagzabad (late second millennium BCE) shows that the dromedary was known on the Iranian Plateau from an early date. In view of this evidence, it could be suggested that the Bactrian camels demanded of Mannae, Ellipi, Namri, Singibutu or Gilzanu would not have been native to those districts, but themselves imported from further east. Presumably, however, the Assyrians would not have demanded Bactrian camels of these regions if they had not seen them there. The question arises, therefore, why were west Iranian communities keeping Bactrian camels, and might this have something to do with their eventual use by the Assyrians? The answer, I suggest, lies in camel hybridization.

From the seventeenth century onward, a series of European travellers, anthropologists and veterinary scientists have amassed an important record of observations of the intentional cross-breeding of Bactrian and dromedary camels (Kolpakow 1935; Menges 1935; Tapper 1985). As with most hybridization, the aim in crossing camels has been to produce a “better” camel, in this case a more robust individual, stronger as a pack animal. In general, the best first generation hybrids are the products of male Bactrians crossed with female dromedaries, although female Bactrians crossed with male dromedaries are also attested. In cultures which practised camel hybridization, the stud function of Bactrian males was paramount, while small numbers of Bactrian females were kept in order to maintain a supply of pure Bactrian males. Tapper provides evidence on this practice over a region extending from Afghanistan to Anatolia. For example, amongst the Shahsevan of Azerbaijan, he observed, “Only the wealthiest of Shahsevan keep Bactrians, both male and female, and solely for breeding purposes. Female Bactrians are rarely if ever bought or sold, though they may change hands as gifts or be demanded as part of a bride-wealth.” (Tapper 1985: 59-60). In Central Asia, Kolpakov (1935: 619) found that 6-7 year old Bactrians were optimal for use as studs.

Although larger and stronger, hybrids look like dromedaries in that they have one hump, though this is normally not very symmetrical and often has a small indentation between 4 and 12 cm deep which divides the rear portion of the hump — often 2-3 times as large as the front — from the front part. Alternatively, the hump may end up looking quite flat, and has been compared to a flattened pyramid.
Hybridization produces a large animal, which can stand 2.32 m high at the hump or 2.15 m high at the shoulder (Kolpakow 1935: 618, n. 5). The legs are long, the height of the camel often greater than its length, and the weight sometimes in the 900–950 kg range, though more often approaching an average of c. 650 kg (Kolpakow 1935: 620).

All of the sources confirm the greater strength and load-bearing abilities of the hybrids and indeed references to hybrids able to carry 400–500 kgs, roughly double that of a dromedary and more than double that of an ordinary Bactrian, are not uncommon. It should not be a surprise then that the sources are also consistent in recording the substantially higher price of hybrids vs dromedaries (Tapper 1985: 57, 59).

There is a considerable body of evidence concerning subsequent generations of hybrids crossed with pure-bred or other hybrid individuals, all of which points to their bad temper, inadequate size and generally poor quality. For this reason, hybrid males were usually castrated (Tapper 1985: 61). As Tapper (1985: 63) notes, “The hybrids were not allowed to breed, as their offspring would be vicious and dangerous.” Statements to the effect that the dromedary-Bactrian crosses were infertile (Gray 1972: 161) are incorrect, and ample evidence demonstrates the contrary (Peters and von den Driesch 1997: 654). Already in the early nineteenth century Eduard Friedrich Eversmann reported seeing fertile offspring in Turkestan (Hartmann 1869: 70).

To sum up, Tapper (1985: 67) notes, “in my experience, the main advantage of the hybrid over the purer species, to both nomadic and commercial users, is less its supposed versatility than its vastly greater size, strength and carrying capacity, its aesthetically pleasing appearance, and its correspondingly greater value, in both financial and ceremonial terms.” In view of the evidence just reviewed, which extends from Anatolia and Syria in the west to Afghanistan in the east, we can safely say that small numbers of Bactrian camels have been kept, over the past 300–400 years, by groups which, in the main, raised dromedaries, for the purpose of producing hybrids of outstanding strength. Further, these hybrids were used specifically as caravan and draught animals. It can at least be suggested, therefore, that the reason why Assyrian kings seized Bactrian camels and demanded them as tribute from Iranian lands to the east of Assyria was to acquire studs and breeding females in order to practice the same sort of hybridization as just outlined, with a view to developing stronger pack animals for a variety of purposes (military, commercial, agricultural). While we have as yet no archaeological evidence of camel hybridization from the Assyrian period, we do have some from later periods in the Near East, which demonstrates that hybridization was practiced in antiquity.

In recent years, zooarchaeologists have identified faunal evidence of camel hybrids at Mleiha in the United Arab Emirates, Troy in western Turkey, and Pella in Jordan. Chronologically, the earliest evidence dates to the Roman or Parthian period. In 1994, Dr. S.A. Jasim excavated an important cemetery near Mleiha, in the interior of Sharjah, United Arab Emirates, which contained the graves of at least 12 camels, most of which, judging from associated finds, date to the first two centuries CE (Jasim 1999). The faunal remains, studied by H.-P. Uerpmann, included three hybrids. Identification of these individuals as hybrids was based on the morphometric analysis of selected bones (axis, astragalus, first phalanx) as compared with dromedary and Bactrian material. In addition to this material, Uerpmann (1999: 111–113) has identified the phalanx of a probable hybrid from a Roman context at Troy. Finally, I. Köhler-Rollefson (1989: 149) has identified possible hybrids amongst the faunal remains from early Islamic Pella, in Jordan. These are presumed to have been killed by an earthquake in 747.

Additional archaeological evidence includes camel figurines from Parthian contexts at Seleucia-on-the-Tigris which, as Bulliet (1975: Fig. 80) noted nearly 30 years ago, exhibit the small indentation in the hump characteristic of the hybrid.

**Conclusion**

The ethnographic and historic observations reviewed above leave one in no doubt about the benefits and geographically widespread evidence of hybridization, while the archaeological evidence from Mleiha and Troy confirms the existence of hybrids by the Roman or Parthian period. But this evidence alone does not sustain Bulliet’s (1990: 731; cf. 1975: 168; Peters and von den Driesch 1997: 654) assertion that Diodorus “contains the first recorded reference to cross breeding of the dromedary and the Bactrian camel.” I would suggest that the Neo-Assyrian sources cited above — the inclusion of Bactrian camels in the list of livestock demanded as tribute by Tiglath-Pileser III and Esarhaddon, the receipt of Bactrian camels from Musri and Gilzanu as shown on the Balawat gates and the Black Obelisk, the loan of Bactrian camels by Danniya, Sennacherib’s capture of Bactrian camels in Merodach-Baladan’s camp, and Assur-bel-
kala’s damaged reference to udrate — all point to the presence of Bactrian camels in Babylonia and Assyria some 500-1000 years before Diodorus observed them. Furthermore, given what we know of the distribution of C. \textit{ferus} and C. \textit{bactrianus}, and of the presence of C. \textit{dromedarius} on the Iranian Plateau at an early date, I would suggest that the Iranian groups, mainly Median, from whom the Assyrians sought Bactrian camels were already engaged in camel hybridization by the time the Assyrians became conscious of the practice. Whether the Syrian cylinder seal from the eighteenth century BCE allows us to push that date even further back in time is difficult to answer, but in view of the ever-increasing body of evidence for ties between Central Asia and Elam (Amiet 1986: 146-207), and between Elam and Assyria and Mari in the early second millennium BCE (Potts 1999: 166ff), it is entirely possible that this was the period in which the peoples of the Near East first became aware of \textit{C. bactrianus}. Whatever the case may be, it is now clear that the Bactrian camel has little beyond its name in common with the region of Bactria, and that its origins lie much further east, on the high steppes of Inner Asia. That it came to play an important role further west, already by the Assyrian period if not earlier, seems clear. The raison d'être behind the Assyrian interest in the Bactrian camel, and behind its later occurrence as far west as Anatolia, lies in the breeding of Bactrian-dromedary hybrids, the strength of which was unsurpassed by any other domestic animal, apart from the elephant, in the ancient Near East.

\textbf{About the Author}

Daniel Potts was educated at Harvard (AB ’75, PhD ’80) and has taught at the Freie Universität Berlin (1981-1986), the Univ. of Copenhagen (1980-1981, 1986-1991) and the Univ. of Sydney (1991- present). He is a specialist in the archaeology of Iran, Mesopotamia and the Persian Gulf, and has published widely on these areas. He is the founding editor of \textit{Arabian Archaeology & Epigraphy}, and is a Fellow of the Australian Academy of the Humanities. He may be contacted at: dan.potts@arts.usyd.edu.au.

\textbf{References}

Amiet 1986

Amschler 1939

Aruz et al. 2000

Badam 1984

Bannikov 1976

Baur et al. 1933

Boardman and Vollenweider 1978

Brentjes 1960

Bulliet 1975

Bulliet 1980

Collon 2000

Compagnoni and Tosi 1978

Curtius 1928

Curtis and Searight 2003
Wapnish 1984

Winkelmann 1999

Zadok 2002

Zeuner 1955

Notes
1. This is a modified version of a lecture delivered for the Inner Asia/Silkroad Study Group (IASSG) and co-sponsored by the Silkroad Foundation and the Stanford University Center for East Asian Studies, 21 October 2004. The paper was based on the author’s “Camel hybridization and the role of Camelus bactrianus in the Ancient Near East,” Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient, 47 (2004): 143-165. Readers interested in finding out more about the topic are advised to consult the 2004 article which has an extensive bibliography as well.

2. This thinness has given rise to the Mongolian name for C. ferus, havtagai, from havtag, meaning ‘flatness’ (Bannikov 1976: 398).

3. C. ferus are also well-represented in the rock art of the Altai, Tul-Kun, Tamurasche, Uryankhai, Turgai and Minusinsk (Suljek) regions between Inner Asia and Siberia but these are difficult to date (Heptner, Nasimovic and Bannikov 1966: 87-88, Abb. 26; Peters and Von den Driesch 1997: 653).

4. Epstein 1969: 120, puts the average load at 120-150 kgs.

5. Olsen did not give a written reference for this information, but referred to the fact that the camellid remains had been “excavated by archaeologists from the Museum of Inner Mongolia in Huhhot” (Olsen 1988: 21), which he visited in the early 1980’s. Dr. Jianjun Mei (Needham Research Institute, Cambridge) kindly looked for written confirmation of this information but was unable to find any.

6. Camelid remains found at Anau-depe in period II contexts were identified as Bactrian on the basis of comparisons with modern Bactrian camels (Duerst 1908; cf. Compagnoni and Tosi 1978: 96 and Table 3), an identification that has recently been reconfirmed (Peters and von den Driesch 1997: 658).

7. Tepe Hissar has no camellid fauna at all (Mashkour and Yaghmayi 1996) while at Zagheh and Tepe Ghabristan (Qabrestan) on the Qazvin plain (west of Tehran), only C. dromedarius seems to have been present in the fourth millennium BCE (Mashkour, Fontugne and Hatte 1999: 71 and Table 2; Mashkour 2002: Table 2). (Dr. Marjan Mashkour [CNRS, Paris] kindly advised me that the quantity of camellid remains at these sites was very small and therefore somewhat surprising. She agreed that caution is required in interpreting this data.) The depiction of a Bactrian camel on a sherd from period III, at Tepe Sialk (Ghirshman 1938: Pl. 79, A2) near Kashan has been interpreted as evidence of C. bactrianus on the Iranian Plateau in the late fourth millennium BCE (Compagnoni and Tosi 1978: Table 3).

8. Further south and east, skeletal remains of Camel sp. — possibly but not definitely Bactrian — have been found in strata assigned to Period II (phases 5-7) at Shahr-i Sokhta in Iranian Seistan (Compagnoni and Tosi 1978: 92), datable to c. 2700-2200 BCE (Voigt and Dyson 1992: 152), most probably to the earlier part of this period. That Seistan, noted for its aridity, is certainly well outside the natural habitat of the C. ferus is suggested by the absence of camel remains in earlier, period I levels at the site, and the absence of camels among the nearly 1300 zoomorphic figurines found there (Peters and von den Driesch 1997: 656).

Faunal remains of probable Bactrian camel dating to the second half of the third millennium BCE (Namazga V period) have been found at Ulug-depe, Altynd-Depe and Namazga-depe in southern Turkmenistan (Peters and von den Driesch 1997: 659), where E.E. Kuzmina thinks “the use of Bactrian camels for draft purposes was a local development...peculiar to southern Central Asia” (Kohl 1984: 114), and at Shah Tepe in northeastern Iran (Compagnoni and Tosi 1978: Table 3; Amschler 1939: 77-80; but queried by Peters and von den Driesch 1997: 660).

9. Their exact provenance is not known, since they were purchased on the antiquities market (e.g. Amiet 1986: Fig. 189c; Sarianidi 1998a: 71-73; nos. 108-111; Winkelmann 1999: Abb. 4). Bactrian camel images are found on soft-stone stamp seals from controlled excavations.
at Togolok 1 (burial 10), Togolok 21 (southern court) and Gonur South (room 592) in Margiana (Sarianidi 1998a: 297, nos. 1634-1635). Gonur North has also yielded a theriomorphic ceramic vessel in the shape of a Bactrian camel and a graffito of a Bactrian camel incised on a ceramic drain pipe (Sarianidi 1998b: Figs. 14-15). Unfortunately, the camelid faunal remains from Gonur cannot be identified to the species level (Meadow 1993: 72, n. 2). A clay bulla with a cylinder seal impression from the *temenos* at Togolok 1 shows a human and a caprid between two Bactrian camels (Sarianidi 1998b: Fig. 28.1 = Winkelmann 1999: 151 and Abb. 19.3).

10. Specifically, at the Andronovo site of Alekseevskoe in Tatarstan (Hancar 1956: 235; Heptner, Nasimovic and Bannikov 1966: 89 says *C. ferus* bones have been found at Andronovo sites as well), in Karasuk culture graves at Il’inskaia gora in the southwestern Ural foothills (Hancar 1956: Tab. 48 and 255; Brentjes 1960: 27), and possibly at the Tripol’e culture site of Gorodsk north of Kiev in Ukraine (Walz 1954: 79-80, n. 3; Hancar 1956: 69, Tab. 22).

11. Camelid faunal remains from Harappan sites of late third and early second millennium BCE have been identified in all cases as dromedary, not Bactrian (e.g. Badam 1984: 349). However, a shaft-hole axe excavated by Sir Aurel Stein in a grave at Khurab, in Iranian Baluchistan, is widely thought to show a Bactrian camel in repose (Zeuner 1955; Lamberg-Karlovsky 1969; During Caspers 1972). At Pirak in Pakistani Baluchistan the period IB-III levels, dating to c. 1800-700 BCE, have yielded numerous clay figurines of Bactrian camels (Santoni 1979: 177-179, Figs. 94-95, Pls. 42B and 43) as well as faunal remains (Meadow 1993: 67, 70).

12. In Iran only *C. dromedarius* is present in the late second millennium BCE levels at Tepe Sazgab (Maskour 2002: Table 2). We cannot be sure that the so-called "Luristan bronze" buckle (4.7 cm. high, 8.7 cm. wide) in the former Foroughi Collection in Tehran, dated stylistically to the 8th/7th centuries BCE, on which a Bactrian camel is depicted (Jettmar 1967: Pl. 45) is in fact a true reflection of the presence of Bactrian camels in western Iran at that time. The provenance of the piece, even if it is authentic, is simply too vague to attribute any geographical significance to it.

13. Bactrian camels appear on so-called "Greco-Persian" seals of late fifth/fourth century BCE date (Nikylina 1994: nos. 207, 216, 493) and on Greek gems, probably of east Greek origin (Boardman and Vollenweider 1978: 114, no. 117). About this time, as well, the earliest references to Bactrian camels occur in late fourth century BCE Chou documents in China, becoming much more prevalent in the Han period (Shafer 1950: 174; cf. Walz 1954: 60; Epstein 1969: 117). Brentjes has surveyed the terracottas and wall paintings from the first millennium BCE and first millennium CE (Brentjes 1960: 28). At least three fragments of Bactrian camel figurines were discovered by the American excavators at Seleucia-on-the-Tigris in the 1930’s (van Ingen 1939: 320, no. 1465a-c and Pl. 76.557). Further Bactrian camel figurines of Seleucid and/or Parthian date are known from Nippur (Douglas 1939: 36 with refs.).

14. Lattimore (1929: 133) observed, "the Mongols prefer a fast camel to a pony for a long journey in haste, if they cannot get relays on the road," favoring young camels which "are much the best for riding, as they are not only faster but softer-gaited" (cf. Geiger 1979 [1882]: 456, on the use of Bactrians by couriers in the Turkmenian deserts during the 19th century).

15. According to Zadok’s (2002: 18ff, 42-3, 70, 77) recent study of western Iran in the Neo-Assyrian period, Mannaea was located to the south of Lake Urmia, Ellipi and Namri in western Luristan, and Singibutu around Khoi in Iranian Azerbaijan.

16. He describes his campaign against Patusharra (Vallat 1993: 214-215), ‘a land that borders on the Salt Desert, in the midst of the land of the distant Medes, near Bikni, the lapis lazuli-mountain, where none of my forefathers had set foot’. Patusharra’s location is uncertain, and depends on that of Mt. Bikni, a mountain which has been variously sought at Mt. Alvand in Luristan, Mt. Demevend near Tehran, or in the Pamirs (for refs. see Zadok 2002: 55).

17. The original source here is Eversmann’s *Reisen von Orenburg nach Buchara...nebst einem naturhistorischen Anhange und einer Vorrede von H. Lichtenstein*, Berlin, 1823: 91.

Fig. 2. Bactrian delegate leading a Bactrian camel on the Apadana reliefs at Persepolis (photograph by the author).
Research Note

One of the Last Documents of the Silk Road: The Khataynameh of Ali Akbar

Ralph Kauz
Institut für Iranistik der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, Vienna

The patterns of trans-Asiatic communication and trade changed dramatically in the course of the fifteenth century. These changes can be divided into three major periods:

1) In the aftermath of Mongol rule in China and in Iran, the first emperors of the Ming dynasty (1368-1644) and the Timurids (1370-1506) as well promoted commercial and political exchange on a large scale. Especially the leading Chinese economy of this period showed its attraction to other Asian kingdoms. Chinese overtures under the early Ming had thus a huge impact, and Chinese envoys who arrived in Samarqand, Herat and other cities of Central and Western Asia by land and others who called at ports of the Western Indian Ocean were well received by the local rulers. Envoys and merchants from these places repaid these visits in the Chinese capital.

2) However, China abandoned its sea expeditions in 1433 and refrained from sending more embassies to Central and Western Asia at around the same time. Consequently, the pattern of mutual communication changed, and henceforth the traffic flowed only in the direction of China. The Ming showed less and less interest in trade with the outside world and regarded the foreign merchants and envoys rather as a nuisance, one mostly tolerated due to the Ming’s own policy of superiority but kindness towards foreigners.

3) Islamic maritime trade sustained much more difficulty at the end of the fifteenth century on account of European expansion, rather than from the previous change of Chinese foreign policy. The Portuguese Estado da Índia supplanted the network of the Arabic and Persian traders, although it could temporarily recover in the middle of the sixteenth century, as did the traditional “Levant route.” At first glance, these European colonial enterprises (first Vasco da Gama and Portugal, then the Dutch Verenigde Oost-Indische Compagnie) seem also to have been responsible for the decline of the Silk Road as a main artery of trans-Asian communication. However, inner Asian developments were rather to blame for the parallel deterioration of the overland route, i.e. the collapse of the Timurid Empire and the subsequent rivalry between the Sunni Shaybanids in Central Asia and the Shi’ite Safavids in Iran which prevented smooth interrelations and interactions as in the centuries before.

Though it would be erroneous to assume a complete breakdown of trans-Asian overland traffic, embassies from Central and Western Asia arrived still in Beijing. We can even find embassies from a kingdom called “Lumi,” registered in the Veritable Records (Ming shilu), offering their tribute since the 1520s for several times at the Chinese court. “Lumi” could well be a transcription of “Rum”, i.e. the Ottoman Empire. These embassies might have been faked — there is no final proof that they really came from the far-away Ottoman Empire, but the interest in “Lumi” evidenced in many contemporary Chinese texts may indicate the genuineness of their origin. The interest of Asian merchants in trade with China did certainly not diminish, though the political situation did not support their eagerness.

One of the most important testimonies of this continuous interest in China is the “Khataynameh” (Book of China), written by ‘Ali Akbar Khata’i in 1516 and issued in Istanbul in 1520. There are but a few manuscripts of this Khataynameh extant (one in the National Library of Egypt in Cairo, three in the Süleymaniye Library and one in the Aya Sofia Library of Istanbul, and another one in the University Library of Leiden). Already under the reign of Sultan Murad, probably in the year 1582, Hoseyn Efendi translated the Persian text into Ottoman Turkish with some omissions and amendments, with the title “Qanunnäme-ye Chin va Khata” (Book of Canons of China and Khatay). Before I turn to a sketch of the modern research on the “Khataynameh”, a brief outline of its content and some considerations on the author may be given.

The work is not a traditional travelogue like, for example, Ghiyas ad-Din’s description of his journey to China as a Timurid ambassador in the beginning of the fifteenth century, but rather a description of China proper. It is divided into twenty chapters, where roads, cities, military, stores, prostitutes, eunuchs, administration, jails, law, agriculture and other matters are discussed. Thus the book gave a reader of the sixteenth century a fair impression of China, and it could well have served as a companion for merchants travelling there. However, the book was issued in Istanbul, and merchants on the Silk Road probably gathered there knowledge from themselves and did not necessarily need a guide book.

For whom was it then written? The question seems to be rather uncomplicated, because it was dedicated to Sultan Süleyman and ‘Ali Akbar might have wished to make an impression on the Ottoman court. Lin Yih-Min describes ‘Ali Akbar as a “Turkish businessman” (1983, p. 58) who probably travelled only to Central Asia, where he gathered the information for his book and returned then to Turkey. However, the name of the author indicates a Shi’ite background. Mazahéry (p. 95) gives justly a vivid sketch of the anti-Shi’ite movements and sentiments at the time of the battle of Chaldiran when the Safavid ruler Isma’el I was defeated by the Ottomans and when ‘Ali Akbar wrote his book. The situation of a Shi’ite in Istanbul in that period was certainly not an easy one, and he might have had good reason to win the sultan’s favour by producing a book on China to spur the geographical interest of the Ottomans. In accordance with Schefer’s assumption (p. 34), a Central Asian origin of ‘Ali Akbar seems rather likely, and ‘Ali Akbar could have been captured by the Ottomans in Chaldiran and saved his life by writing a book about his former experiences as a merchant.
The question of whether he had actually been in China2 will not be discussed here, but it might be stressed that he reported at least the knowledge of China circulating among contemporary merchants dealing with China. This knowledge was by no means meager, as the “Khataynameh” proves, and one may wonder if it was not an incentive for the aforementioned embassies from “Lumi” to China.

The “Khataynameh” aroused considerable interest not only in the Ottoman Empire but also in Europe in the early nineteenth century. Mattheaus Norberg used the Turkish “Qanunnamah” for his Latin commentaries on China in the course of his translation of and research on Marco Polo’s narrative. This “Qanunnamah” was also the basic of the studies of Zenker and Fleischer. It was Charles Schefer who discovered the Persian original in the Suleymaniye Library and translated three chapters of it. Paul Kahle started to make a complete translation with the assistance of Muhammad Hamidullah. This was in fact finished in manuscript but never published. Kahle even exchanged letters with the famous Chinese scholar Zhang Xinglang in order to invite him to Germany for work on the “Khataynameh”, but due to the situation of Germany in the 1930s the journey of Zhang Xinglang proved to be impossible. A late fruit of this communication was the Chinese translation of Hamidullah’s and Kahle’s translation by the son of Zhang Xinglang, Zhang Zhishan, and Kahle’s translation by the son of ‘Ali Akbar ‘Akbar Khatâ’î.

References


Notes

1. For more detailed descriptions see Kahle (1933), Lin Yih-Min (1983), or the translation of Mazaheri.

2. For conflicting views see Kahle (1933) and Lin Yih-Min (1983).